

## **NOSB Report Spring 2015**

The National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) held its public meeting **April 27-30** in La Jolla, CA. View <u>Meeting Agenda (PDF)</u>. Below is an overview of the meeting presentations and highlights followed by a summary chart providing an at-a-glance view of all NOSB proposals and final decisions. A complete transcript of this meeting will eventually be posted on the National Organic Program (NOP) website. The final recommendations will be posted in the near future at www.ams.usda.gov/NOSBMeetings.

To better understand the proposals and discussion documents reported on below, <u>READ</u> OTA's user-friendly summary on all meeting agenda topics. We also developed a comprehensive resource booklet in preparation for the meeting that provides additional background along with OTA's positions. This informative booklet can be <u>viewed as a flipbook</u> or as a <u>downloadable PDF</u>. Quick summaries of discussion, public comments, and votes can be found on OTA Twitter: <a href="https://twitter.com/organictrade">https://twitter.com/organictrade</a>.

## **PRESENTATIONS BY USDA**

National Organic Program (NOP) Deputy Administrator Miles McEvoy began the meeting by providing an update on NOP's efforts to ensure integrity in the organic marketplace. He announced that the long-awaited 'origin of livestock' proposed rule is published and open for public comment, and that one of its top priorities in rulemaking for this year includes acting on the NOSB animal welfare recommendation passed in 2011. Other rulemaking priorities for NOP include aquaculture, pet food, sodium nitrate, mushrooms and apiculture. Special policy-related projects include drafting policy on grower groups, responding to pesticide drift, inspector qualifications, and private labels. McEvoy stressed the importance of collaboration, partnership and good communication. He acknowledged the concerns the agency is hearing about NOP Policy Memos that are released without an opportunity for public comment. NOP is exploring the possibility of publishing interim policy memos so there is an opportunity for stakeholders to provide feedback in the future. McEvoy's report also addressed controversial issues such as hydroponics, nanotechnology, electrolyzed water and biodegradable mulch. McEvoy concluded by thanking everyone for contributing to the growth of organic agriculture. *View Presentation*: NOP Update (PDF)

Dr. Lisa Brines, USDA's NOP National List Manager, gave a presentation and materials update on the National List. Dr. Brines reviewed the status of several petitions currently in progress, briefly reviewed the National List \*materials to be discussed and voted on at this meeting and the Sunset materials that will be voted on at the fall 2015 meeting. Dr. Brines pointed out that the majority of the 200+ materials on the National List are scheduled to sunset in 2017. View Presentation: Materials Update (PDF) (\*materials = farm/livestock inputs, ingredients, processing aids)

Other presentations included an <u>Update on Inerts (PDF)</u> by Emily Brown Rosen, NOP Standards Division staff member, and an overview of the <u>Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) Safer Choice Program (PDF)</u> by Clive Davies, Chief of the Design for the Environment Branch at EPA. NOSB is

currently considering a collaboration with EPA's Safer Choice Program to evaluate inert ingredients used in pest control products allowed in organic production.

#### **MEETING OVERVIEW & HIGHLIGHTS**

- Setting the Stage: Jean Richardson, an organic inspector from Vermont representing consumer/public interests, chaired the meeting and once again set a tone of civil discourse. She reminded the Board and the audience of the synergy we create when we try to seek common ground. She promised the audience that she would run a "tight ship" with a bit of humor and welcomed outrageous behavior provided it is done concisely and politely. Finally, Jean acknowledged the exceptional quality of the written comments and the professional manner by which they were constructed, and commended this board for their collegial work and detailed analysis of the National List materials. Richardson exclaimed, "We've left no stone unturned!"
- **Public Comments:** Over the course of the four-day meeting, NOSB heard comments from approximately 124 members of the public on a number of issues. NOSB discussed these and other comments of support and suggested changes from 1,250 <u>written comments</u>. Jean Richardson pointed out that NOSB members do, in fact, read everyone's written comments. Considering the 190+ National List Materials that will be voted on at the fall 2015 meeting, she asked that the public please consider the tremendous amount of time this will take and refrain from providing oral comment if they simply repeat the previously submitted written comments. OTA's final comments are posted on <u>OTA's website</u>.
- Maintaining the National List: There were 10 petitioned materials on the agenda along with 12 materials for Sunset 2016 and 198 material listings for Sunset 2017. Keeping in line with a no-growth trend to the National List since 2008, the net result from this meeting was the removal of 5 inputs from the list of allowed non-organic ingredients (handling) and the addition of 2 alternative healthcare treatments (livestock). NOSB denied 7 out of the 9 petitions to add NEW inputs to the National List. This outcome is largely consistent with OTA's comments. NOSB completed its review of the 2016 Sunset Materials at this meeting, and will complete the Sunset 2017 review at its fall 2015 meeting.
- Petitions to add NEW inputs to the National List: NOP discussed and voted on 9 petitions. See the summary chart below for more detail.
  - Passed will be ADDED to the National List upon NOP approval and rulemaking:
    - o Livestock: Zinc Sulfate and Acidified Sodium Chlorite (both alternative healthcare treatments)
  - Failed will continue to be PROHIBITED in organic production and handling:
    - o Crops: Exhaust Gas; Calcium Sulfate; and 3-decen-2-one
    - o Handling: Whole Algal Flour; Ammonium Hydroxide; Polyalkylene Glycol Monobutyl Ether (PGME); and Triethyl Citrate

- **2016 Sunset Materials:** The final decision was to remove five of the ten handling inputs scheduled to expire in 2016. Five handling inputs and two crop inputs were renewed. See the summary chart below for more detail.
  - Relist for continued allowance:
    - o Crops: Ferric Phosphate (slug control) and Hydrogen Chloride (cottonseed delinting)
    - o Handling: L-Malic Acid; Microorganisms; Activated Charcoal; Peracetic Acid; and Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate
  - Remove from the National List and no longer allowed in organic handling:
    - Handling: Egg White Lysozyme; Boiler Additives (Cyclohexylamine, Diethylaminoethanol, Octadecylamine); and Tetrasodium Pyrophosphate. All of these ingredients or processing aids were deemed as non-essential to organic handling due to the availability of natural/organic alternatives or alternative processing practices (e.g., steam generator to replace the boiler water additives).
- 2017 Sunset Materials: The Crops, Livestock and Handling Subcommittees presented their initial review for 198 material listings for Sunset 2017. During the discussions, NOSB clearly indicated which of the 2017 Sunset ingredients and production inputs they are flagging for potential removal from the National List. The summary chart below provides more detailed information on which materials the Board is favoring for removal and/or requesting more input from stakeholders.
- OTA's Sunset Surveys: In addition to providing written comments directly to NOSB during the open comment period in fall 2015, certified organic producers and handlers may weigh in AT ANY TIME using OTA's survey system for collecting feedback. Based on meeting discussions, the information collected to-date proved to be highly effective. OTA was able to submit a total of 456 unique responses to NOSB, and the responses were cited throughout the meeting. In many cases, even one or two survey responses informed NOSB of the need to relist or remove a National List material. PLEASE NOTE: NOSB is considering removing National List items if they have not received any comments from industry expressing the need for their continued allowance.
- Sunset Review Process: This meeting marked the second time NOSB completed Sunset Reviews of materials following the revised Sunset procedures released by USDA in September 2014. The change to the Sunset process did not affect any of the Sunset votes that took place at this meeting; all votes were decisive (2/3 majority). This meeting once again showed that the changes to the Sunset policy are working well to engage organic stakeholders and allow Board members to make the best-informed decisions they can.
- **Glycerin (petition to remove):** After several rounds of reviewing a petition to remove synthetic glycerin from the National List as an allowed handling ingredient, NOSB unanimously voted to allow the use of non-organic agricultural (non-synthetic) glycerin in organic products only when organic forms are commercially unavailable. Upon completion of rulemaking, synthetic glycerin will be removed from the National List and prohibited for use in NOP certified products. Non-organic agricultural (non-synthetic) forms of glycerin may be used in natural flavors

and "made with" products without the requirement to source organic. In support of the development and use of organic and natural alternatives, comments were largely in support of this proposal. The final decision is consistent with OTA's comments.

- Methionine (petition to revise the annotation on the current listing): Methionine is a synthetic essential amino acid currently allowed on the National List for inclusion in organic poultry diets at specific rates. NOSB discussed and voted on a proposal to CHANGE the current allowance of synthetic methionine from a rate expressed as a maximum (pounds per ton) to an <u>average</u> rate calculated over the life of the bird. NOSB heard comments from organic poultry producers who indicated that synthetic methionine remained necessary for proper nutrition, from organic certifiers who indicated that an average approach would be enforceable, and from organic consumer groups who remain steadfast in the need to phase out synthetic methionine from organic poultry production. NOSB discussion focused on striking an appropriate balance between the realities of farm production and consumer preference and continued trust in the organic label. Consistent with the subcommittee vote, the proposal passed (10 in favor, 4 opposed, 1 absent). Additionally, NOSB resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of finding natural alternatives. The final decision is consistent with OTA comments.
- Ancillary Substances (Proposal): The Handling Subcommittee was tasked with reviewing "ancillary substances," which are intentionally added to a formulated generic handling substance on the National List. These substances do not have a technical or functional effect in the finished product, and are not considered part of the manufacturing process that has already been reviewed by the NOSB. The subcommittee voted in favor of the approval of several ancillary substances for use with Microorganisms, because they keep them alive, pure and able to perform. It also recommended that ancillary substances be sourced organically if they are available. The subcommittee received several comments in disagreement with the requirement to source organic ancillary substances. Several commenters also stated that the recommendation is unclear and needs more work. The proposal was tabled for further work and will likely be back on the agenda for the spring 2016 meeting.
- GMO Contamination Prevention (Discussion Documents): NOSB continues to make strides to improve our ability to keep GMOs out of organic food, feed and seed. This meeting highlighted a seed panel of experts who presented views and data on the current realities of establishing a seed purity standard for organic and/or non-organic seed. Expert panelists included Dr. Jim Myers of Oregon State University, Mac Ehrhardt of Albert Lea Seed, Charles Brown of Brownseed Genetics Inc., and Matthew Dillon of Seed Matters and Clif Bar Foundation. The take-home message delivered by all four panelists is that more testing and data must be collected per crop (corn, soy, alfalfa, etc.) in order to evaluate the feasibility of any standard, especially as it relates to establishing a threshold. View: Seed Purity Panel presentations (PDF). Consistent with OTA's comments, the Materials Subcommittee will explore the possibility of convening a task force or working group that could advise on a plan and timeline for collecting the necessary data to inform the next steps. The discussion documents on Excluded Methods Terminology and Guidance on GMO Prevention Strategy unfortunately received very little comment. NOSB is urging organic stakeholders to weigh in on these critical topics. Both topics will be back on the agenda for the spring 2016 meeting.

- Contaminated Farm Input Plan (Report): The Crops Subcommittee discussed its report which outlines a path for evaluating each potential contaminant (pesticides, heavy metals, etc.) from each potential farm input (fertilizers, compost, manure, etc.) with a goal to identify prevention strategies and remediation techniques to help organic farmers avoid contaminated inputs. Numerous commenters supported the effort to reduce the impact contamination from inputs may have on organic farmers, and encouraged NOSB to look to experts in these fields to develop appropriate guidance on contamination avoidance, as this is a extremely complicated and diverse topic.
- Aquaculture Legacy Document: The Livestock Subcommittee provided a timeline and analysis of action by NOSB on reviewing synthetic materials for use in organic aquaculture. The subcommittee had previously tabled discussions on aquaculture materials until NOP issues a proposed rule on organic aquaculture standards. The proposed rule has yet to be released, but this document provides a clear summary of NOSB action to-date and restates the subcommittee's intention to revisit aquaculture materials upon issuance of a proposed rule. NOSB members reviewed the Legacy Document for accuracy and omissions, and were in general support of the material. Few public commenters addressed this document, in particular, while some did continue to express opposition to organic aquaculture standards that allowed the use of ocean-based net pen systems.
- Subcommittee Tentative Work Plans: At the end of the meeting, NOSB announced its tentative work plan for the FALL 2015 meeting. The final work plan is now available on the NOSB meeting website. View: NOSB 2015 Work Agenda (PDF). Due to the number of National List items NOSB will be voting on at the fall 2015 meeting, the fall meeting agenda will largely be dedicated to 2017 Sunset Materials. Unless a topic is absolutely essential or directly related to the Sunset decisions (such as the OTA petitions on Natural Flavors and Lignin Sulfonate), it will be pushed back to the spring or fall 2016 meeting.

## **MOTIONS AND FINAL DECISIONS ON ALL AGENDA ITEMS**

Below is a summary chart of all subcommittee discussion documents, proposals and corresponding final NOSB decisions. Quick summaries of discussion, public comments, and votes can be found on OTA Twitter: <a href="https://twitter.com/organictrade">https://twitter.com/organictrade</a>.

#### **Motions and Votes**

As specified in the Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA), two-thirds of the votes cast at an NOSB meeting at which a quorum is present shall be decisive of any motion [§2119(i)]. As there are 15 NOSB members, 10 votes in favor are needed to pass any recommendation.

- Non-material related proposals: two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of the motion for the recommendation to pass
- **Petition to** add or remove a material to/from the National List: two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of adding (or removing) the material in order for USDA to have the authority to add or remove the material to/from the National List
- **Sunset Review proposals:** two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of <u>removing a material</u> in order for USDA to amend the National List. If two-thirds of NOSB vote to remove and USDA accepts the recommendation, then USDA will pursue rulemaking.

# Note: Items highlighted in RED will be *removed* from the National List following NOP approval and rulemaking

Subcommittee	Agenda Item	Motion and Subcommittee Votes	FINAL VOTE: RELIST/ADD/REMOVE
Handling:	Synthetic Glycerin	REMOVE from the National List as an allowed	PASSED: Agricultural forms may be used only
Proposal (Petition)		synthetic and add it to *205.606 as an allowed	when organic forms are not available in
		agricultural (non-synthetic) ingredient that can	quantity, quality or form. Synthetic glycerin will
		only be used when organic forms are not available	no longer be allowed.
		(6 yes, 0 No, 2 Absent)	Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1
Handling:	Whole Algal Flour	ADD to the National List as an allowed non-	FAILED - WILL NOT BE ADDED
Proposal (Petition)		synthetic non-allergen ingredient option	Whole Algal Flour will continue to be <b>prohibited</b>
		(0 Yes, 6 No, 2 Absent)	in organic handling Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1
Handling:	Ammonium Hydroxide	ADD to the National List as an allowed synthetic	PETITION WAS WITHDRAWN
Proposal (Petition)		boiler water additive	Ammonium Hydroxide will continue to be
			prohibited in organic handling
Handling:	Polyalkylene Glycol	ADD to the National List as an allowed synthetic	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED
Proposal (Petition)	Monobutyl Ether	processing aid for livestock pellet production	PGME will continue to be <b>prohibited</b> in organic
	(PGME)	(0 Yes, 7 No, 1 Absent)	handling
			Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1
Handling:	Triethyl Citrate	ADD to the National List as an allowed synthetic	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED
Proposal (Petition)		foam stabilizer (e.g. whipping enhancer for eggs)	Will continue to be <b>prohibited</b> in organic
		(0 Yes, 7 No, 1 Absent)	handling
			Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1
Handling:	Ancillary Substances	ACCEPT a chart of allowed ancillary substances	<b>TABLED</b> – Subcommittee will revisit this topic in
Proposal	Permitted in	that could be used in microorganism products and	spring 2016
	Microorganisms	require organic forms of ancillary substances when	
		available	
		(6 yes, 0 no, 2 Absent)	
Handling:	Egg White Lysozyme	REMOVE from the National List as an allowed non-	<b>REMOVE</b> – Following NOP approval and
Sunset 2016		synthetic processing aid. Egg White Lysozyme is	rulemaking, Egg White Lysozyme will <b>no longer</b>
Proposal		used as a natural anti-microbial in wine and	be allowed in organic handling
		cheese.	
		Subcommittee voted to RELIST	Yes: 11 remove No: 3 relist Absent: 1
		(0 yes, 5 No, 3 Absent)	

L-Malic Acid	REMOVE from the National List as an allowed non-	<b>RELIST</b> – L-Malic Acid will continue to be
	synthetic. L-Malic Acid is commonly used as a	allowed in organic handling
	flavor enhancer and for pH adjustment.	
	Subcommittee voted to RELIST	Yes: 2 remove No: 12 relist Absent: 1
	(0 yes, 5 No, 3 Absent)	
Microorganisms	REMOVE from the National List as an allowed non-	<b>RELIST</b> – Microorganisms will continue to be
	synthetic used for multiple fermented food	allowed in organic handling
	applications.	
	Subcommittee voted to RELIST	Yes: 0 remove No: 14 relist Absent: 1
	(0 yes, 6 No, 2 Absent)	
Activated Charcoal	REMOVE from the National List as an allowed	RELIST- Activated Charcoal will continue to be
	synthetic filtering aid	allowed in organic handling as a filter aid
	Subcommittee voted to RELIST	
	(0 yes, 5 No, 3 Absent)	Yes: 1 remove No: 13 relist Absent: 1
Peracetic Acid	REMOVE from the National List as an allowed	RELIST - Peracetic Acid will continue to be
	synthetic sanitizer	allowed in organic handling
	Subcommittee voted to RELIST	
	(0 yes, 7 No, 1 Absent)	Yes: 0 remove No: 14 relist Absent: 1
Sodium acid	REMOVE from the National List as an allowed	RELIST – SAPP will continue to be allowed in
pyrophosphate (SAPP)	synthetic for use as a leavening agent <b>only</b>	organic handling as a leavening agent.
	Subcommittee voted to RELIST	
	(0 yes, 5 No, 3 Absent)	Yes: 3 remove No: 11 relist Absent: 1
Tetrasodium	Remove from the National List as an allowed	RELIST - Following NOP approval and
pyrophosphate (TSPP)	synthetic that may only be used in meat analog	rulemaking, TSPP will <b>no longer be allowed</b> in
	products	organic handling
	Subcommittee voted to REMOVE	
	(6 yes, 0 No, 2 Absent)	Yes: 14 remove No: 0 relist Absent: 1
<b>Boiler Additives</b>	Remove from the National List as allowed	REMOVE - Following NOP approval and
-Cyclohexylamine	synthetic boiler water additives for packaging	rulemaking, all three boiler additives will <b>no</b>
-Diethylaminoethanol	sterilization	longer be allowed in organic handling for direct
-	Subcommittee voted to REMOVE all three	contact with product or production packaging
	(5 yes, 0 No, 3 Absent)	Yes: 14 remove No: 0 relist Absent: 1
	Microorganisms  Activated Charcoal  Peracetic Acid  Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SAPP)  Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP)  Boiler Additives -Cyclohexylamine	synthetic. L-Malic Acid is commonly used as a flavor enhancer and for pH adjustment.  Subcommittee voted to RELIST (0 yes, 5 No, 3 Absent)  Microorganisms  REMOVE from the National List as an allowed nonsynthetic used for multiple fermented food applications.  Subcommittee voted to RELIST (0 yes, 6 No, 2 Absent)  Activated Charcoal  REMOVE from the National List as an allowed synthetic filtering aid  Subcommittee voted to RELIST (0 yes, 5 No, 3 Absent)  Peracetic Acid  REMOVE from the National List as an allowed synthetic sanitizer  Subcommittee voted to RELIST (0 yes, 7 No, 1 Absent)  Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SAPP)  Sodium acid pyrophosphate (SAPP)  Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP)  Tetrasodium pyrophosphate (TSPP)  Remove from the National List as an allowed synthetic that may only be used in meat analog products  Subcommittee voted to REMOVE (6 yes, 0 No, 2 Absent)  Remove from the National List as allowed synthetic that may only be used in meat analog products  Subcommittee voted to REMOVE (6 yes, 0 No, 2 Absent)  Remove from the National List as allowed synthetic boiler water additives for packaging sterilization  Subcommittee voted to REMOVE all three

Sunset 2017  (schedule to expire in 2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next olumn 2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next house place place at the next house place place at the next house place	Hanadiin a	Compart 2017 Materials	DISCUSSION ONLY. The surk conscitted flagged the	DUDUIC COMMENT IS NIFEDED ON THE
2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).  2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).  2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).  2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).  2018. Moss will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  2019. Motion in Organic Proposal (Petition)  2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).  2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).  2018. Moss will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  2019. Motion to CHANGE the current allowance of synthetic methionine used as an essential amino acid in organic poultry feed an average orate calculated over the life of the bird.  2019. Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  2019. Motion to CHANGE the current allowance of synthetic methionine used as an essential amino acid in organic poultry feed rations from a rate expressed as a maximum (pounds per ton) to an average over the life of the bird.  2019. Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  2019. Motion to CHANGE the current allowance of synthetic methionine used as an essential amino acid in organic poultry production will be measured as an average over the life of the bird.  2019. Nos 4 Absent: 1  2019. Nos 5 sommitted to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  2019. Nos 0  2019. PassED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment vest.  2019. PassED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed	Handling:	Sunset 2017 Materials	<b>DISCUSSION ONLY:</b> The subcommittee flagged the	PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE
vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).  Possible place at the next NOSB meeting).  It westock:  Proposal (Petition)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Additionally, the subcommitted to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Addiffied Sodium Chlorite  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Sunset 2017 (schedule  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Sunset 2017 (schedule  ADS to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Elivestock:  Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Elivestock:  Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Elivestock:  Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Elivestock:  Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Elivestock:  Bable The amount of methionine allowate of synthetic menon grass, celery powder, colors, gelatin, dillived oil, frozen palangal, whey protein concentrate, sweet potato starch, and cornstante or synthetic menon grass, celery powder, colors, gelatin, dillived oil, frozen palangal, whey protein concentrate, sweet potato starch, and cornstante or synthetic methionine allowate of synthetic methionine allowate of synthetic methionine allowate or synthetic methionine or organic poultr	Sunset 2017	1 .		
take place at the next NOSB meeting).  The proposal (Petition)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Li		· ·	,	
NOSB meeting).  received on this first round of review NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  Methionine in Organic Proposal (Petition)  Proposal (Petition)  Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Additional (Aleys, 1 No, 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post leat dip (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE  Phosphate, sodium phosphates. Agricultural: Chia seeds, chipotle peppers, frozen lemon grass, celery powder, colors, gelatin, dillweed oil, frozen galangal, whey protein concentrate, sweet potato starch, and cornstarch.  PASSED – The amount of methionine allowed in organic poultry production will be measured as an average over the life of the bird.  Passed – The amount of methionine allowed in organic poultry production will be measured as an average over the life of the bird.  Pes: 10 No: 4 Absent: 1  NoSB is committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  Yes: 15 No: 0  PASSED – Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  NosB is committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternative health care treatment  Yes: 15 No: 0  PASSED – Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment  Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1		_		
NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  Methionine in Organic Proposal (Petition)  Poultry Feed  Motion to CHANGE the current allowance of synthetic methionine used as an essential amino acid in organic poultry feed rations from a rate expressed as a maximum (pounds per ton) to an average over the life of the bird. Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.  Posted Posted Posted to materials at the following protein concentrate, sweet potato starch, and cornstarch.  PASSED - The amount of methionine allowed in organic poultry production will be measured as an average over the life of the bird.  Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  NOSB is committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  Yes: 15 No: 0  NOSB will be measured as an average over the life of the bird.  NOSB is committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  Yes: 15 No: 0  NOSB is committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  Yes: 15 No: 0  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment yes: 14 No: 0 Abse		· ·		, ,
NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.    Nosb will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.   Frozen lemon grass, celery powder, colors, gelatin, dillweed oil, frozen galangal, whey protein concentrate, sweet potato starch, and cornstarch.		NOSB meeting).	received on this first round of review	
the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.    Characteristic   Char				
Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Methionine in Organic Poultry Feed Proposal (Petition)  Motion to CHANGE the current allowance of synthetic methionine used as an essential amino acid in organic poultry feed rations from a rate expressed as a maximum (pounds per ton) to an average over the life of the bird.  Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Additionally absenting the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule)  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  Proposal (Public Comment as potation and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  Yes: 10 No: 4 Absent: 1  NOSB is committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  Yes: 15 No: 0  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule)  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the			_	
Livestock: Methionine in Organic Proposal (Petition)  Poultry Feed Poultry Production will be measured as an average over the life of the bird. Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent) Poultry Production will be measured as an average over the life of the bird. Yes: 10 No: 4 Absent: 1  NOSB is committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent) PasseD - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Zinc Sulfate ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the Public COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE			the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.	
Methionine in Organic Proposal (Petition)   Poultry Feed   Poultry Feed Feet   Poultry Feed   Poultry Feed   Poultry Feed   Poultry Production will be measured as an average over the life of the bird. Yes: 10 No: 4 Absent: 1   No: 9				
Proposal (Petition) Poultry Feed  synthetic methionine used as an essential amino acid in organic poultry feed rations from a rate expressed as a maximum (pounds per ton) to an average rate calculated over the life of the bird. Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No; 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Birch Step Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE				
acid in organic poultry feed rations from a rate expressed as a maximum (pounds per ton) to an average rate calculated over the life of the bird.  Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic clivestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Bivestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the				
expressed as a maximum (pounds per ton) to an average rate calculated over the life of the bird.  Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Chlorite  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment  Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment  Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule)  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the	Proposal (Petition)	Poultry Feed	·	
average rate calculated over the life of the bird. Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Acidified Sodium Chlorite  Acidified Sodium Chlorite  ApD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ApD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ApD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ApD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  POBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE				
Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Chlorite  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE				Yes: 10 No: 4 Absent: 1
committed to the phase-out of synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Acidified Sodium Chlorite  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Clivestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  Synthetic methionine for organic poultry production and encourages aggressive research for alternatives.  Yes: 15 No: 0  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE			_	
methionine in favor of natural alternatives.  (6 yes, 2 No, 0 Absent)  Acidified Sodium Proposal (Petition)  Chlorite  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE			Additionally, the subcommittee resolved to remain	NOSB is committed to the phase-out of
for alternatives.  Yes: 15 No: 0  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Chlorite  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  Chlorite  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1			committed to the phase-out of synthetic	synthetic methionine for organic poultry
Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Livestock: Acidified Sodium Chlorite  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the			methionine in favor of natural alternatives.	production and encourages aggressive research
Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Acidified Sodium Chlorite  ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock:  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE				for alternatives.
Proposal (Petition)  Chlorite  synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip (4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the				<b>Yes:</b> 15 <b>No:</b> 0
(4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)  allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1  Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE	Livestock:	Acidified Sodium	ADD to the National List at *205.603 as an allowed	PASSED - Following NOP approval and
Livestock: Proposal (Petition)  Zinc Sulfate  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Passed - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE	Proposal (Petition)	Chlorite	synthetic livestock pre/post teat dip	rulemaking, Acidified Sodium Chlorite will be
Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Zinc Sulfate  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  Zinc Sulfate  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment  Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE			(4 Yes, 1 No, 3 Absent)	allowed in organic livestock production as an
Livestock:  Proposal (Petition)  Zinc Sulfate  ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  PASSED - Following NOP approval and rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment  Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule  DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the				alternative health care treatment
Proposal (Petition)  synthetic livestock input for foot baths only (4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be allowed in organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment  Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE				Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1
(4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)  organic livestock production as an alternative health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1  Livestock:  Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE	Livestock:	Zinc Sulfate	ADD to the National List at 205.603 as an allowed	PASSED - Following NOP approval and
health care treatment Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1 Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE	Proposal (Petition)		synthetic livestock input for foot baths only	rulemaking, Zinc Sulfate will be <b>allowed</b> in
Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1 Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE			(4 Yes, 3 No, 1 Absent)	organic livestock production as an alternative
Livestock: Sunset 2017 (schedule DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE				health care treatment
				Yes: 12 No: 2 Absent: 1
Sunset 2017 to expire in 2017. livestock production inputs in the next column as FOLLOWING:	Livestock:	Sunset 2017 (schedule	<b>DISCUSSION ONLY:</b> The subcommittee flagged the	PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE
	Sunset 2017	to expire in 2017.	livestock production inputs in the next column as	FOLLOWING:

	However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).	ones they are considering for <b>REMOVAL</b> in the fall, or as ones they have expressly requested comments for due to the lack of comments received on this first round of review  NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.	Furosemide: Used to treat pulmonary edema and hypercalcemia Parasiticides (Ivermectin and Moxidectin): Used to control internal parasites in organic breeder stock and dairy animals only Poloxalene: Used for emergency bloat treatment Copper Sulfate: Used as hoof bath to treat foot conditions Mineral Oil: Used for topical treatments / lubricant
Crops: Proposal (Petition)	Exhaust Gas	ADD to the National List at *205.601 as an allowed synthetic pest (burrowing rodents) control input (0 Yes, 5 No, 2 Absent)	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED  Exhaust Gas will continue to be prohibited in organic crop production  Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1
Crops: Proposal (Petition)	Calcium Sulfate (GYPSUM) produced by the flue gas desulfurization	ADD to the National List at 205.601 as an allowed synthetic soil and crop input (0 Yes, 6 No, 1 Absent)	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED  Calcium Sulfate will continue to be prohibited in organic crop production  Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1
Crops: Proposal (Petition)	3-decen-2-one	ADD to the National List at 205.601 as an allowed synthetic crop production aid (plant growth regulator). (0 Yes, 5 No, 1 Absent)	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED  3-decen-2-one will continue to be prohibited in organic crop production  Yes: 14 No: 0 Absent: 1
Crops: Proposal (Petition)	Ferric phosphate	Remove from the National List at 205.601 as an allowed synthetic crop input used for delinting cotton seed prior to planting.  The majority voted to REMOVE (split vote)  (2 Yes, 3 No, 2 absent)	RELIST - Ferric phosphate will continue to be allowed in organic crop production  Yes: 14 remove No: 0 relist Absent: 1
Crops: Proposal (Petition)	Hydrogen chloride	Remove from the National List at 205.601 as an allowed synthetic crop input used for slug control. <i>The majority voted to RELIST</i> (0 Yes, 5 No, 3 absent)	RELIST - Hydrogen chloride will continue to be allowed in organic crop production  Yes: 14 remove No: 0 relist Absent: 1

Crops: Sunset 2017	Sunset 2017 (schedule to expire in 2017. However, the vote for relisting will take place at the next NOSB meeting).	DISCUSSION ONLY: The subcommittee flagged the crop production inputs in the next column as ones they are considering for REMOVAL in the fall, or as ones they have expressly requested comments for due to the lack of comments received on this first round of review  NOSB will vote on the relisting of 2017 materials at the fall 2015 in Stowe, Vermont.	PUBLIC COMMENT IS NEEDED ON THE FOLLOWING: Lignin Sulfonate: Used as a floatation agent in post-harvest handling (NOSB does not flag its use as chelation agent/dust suppressant for removal) Vitamins B1, C, and E: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment Ethylene: Used to regulate pineapple flowering and de-greening citrus EPA List 4 Inerts of Minimal Concern: NOSB indicated their intention to consider the prohibition on Nonylphenol Ethoxylates (NPEs), specifically, in organic pesticide products
Certification, Compliance, & Accreditation: Proposal	NOP Peer Review Panel	ACCEPT the Peer Review Proposal in support of NOP's peer review process and a panel that will review NOP's oversight of 3 <sup>rd</sup> party certification agencies.  (8 yes, 0 no, 1 Absent)	PASSED – Proposal will be forwarded to NOP for approval  Yes: 15 No: 0
Materials / GMO: Discussion	Excluded Methods Terminology	DISCUSSION ONLY: Posted for additional discussion and feedback to inform a future proposal on updating the terminology in the regulation used to express the prohibition on the use of excluded methods (GMOs).	NOSB will continue its work and <b>REVISIT</b> the topic in fall of 2015 or spring 2016
Materials / GMO: Discussion	Prevention Strategy on Excluded Methods	DISCUSSION ONLY: Posted for additional discussion and feedback to inform a future proposal on precautions organic producers and handlers should take to prevent contact with GMOs.	NOSB will continue its work and <b>REVISIT</b> this topic in fall of 2015 or spring 2016

<sup>\*</sup>National List References: 205.606 = allowed non-organic agricultural ingredient only when OG is not available / 205.601 = allowed synthetic crop input / 205.603 = allowed synthetic livestock input

### Why do the Sunset Subcommittee Proposals include a "motion to remove?"

As expressed in the proposals released for the Fall 2014 meeting, the Crops and Handling Subcommittee believes that the full Board should have the opportunity to complete the review of each Sunset material by voting. NOP has stated that to do this, a **motion to remove** should be brought from the Subcommittee for each substance. The purpose of a motion is to introduce the topic for consideration while the vote determines the final recommendation. Even if the Subcommittee "motion to remove" fails to receive a simple majority, the motion will still be put forward to the full Board for review. The "motion to remove" is then considered and voted on by the full Board, and needs to receive a 2/3 majority to recommend removal.

**IMPORTANT:** NOSB is an advisory body to the Secretary of Agriculture. NOSB recommendations are not NOP policy unless NOP issues Final rules, Final guidance, Final instructions, or a policy memorandum that adopts the NOSB recommendations. They are not part of the USDA organic regulations unless such action is taken.

**Plan to attend the fall NOSB meeting!** OTA member participation is needed now more than ever! There are 198 materials on the National List scheduled to Sunset in 2017. NOSB will be voting on all of them at the fall 2015 meeting in Stowe, Vermont. The meeting will take place on October 26-29 at the Stoweflake Conference Center. Public comments from the organic industry are requested. If you would like to submit written comments and/or attend the meeting, please contact <a href="Gwendolyn Wyard">Gwendolyn Wyard</a>.

## **Organic Trade Association NOSB Report**

As a service to its members, OTA attends National Organic Standards Board meetings. The *NOSB Report*, a members-only publication, summarizes the meeting and provides an overview of the agenda topics, public commentary, and key decisions made NOSB.

The items included in this report represent recommendations that NOSB developed and reviewed at its meetings. If accepted by the Board, recommendations pass to the National Organic Program, which determines the final form of the NOSB recommendations. OTA members are alerted to steps in rulemaking through OTA's *News Flash* or other member communications.

OTA's <u>NOSB Report archives</u> are available on the OTA website. Please contact OTA's Senior Director of Regulatory and Technical Affairs <u>Gwendolyn</u> <u>Wyard</u> or <u>Nathaniel Lewis</u>, OTA's Senior Crops and Livestock Specialist.

Headquarters: The Hall of the States, 444 N. Capitol St. NW, Suite 445-A, Washington D.C. 20001 – (202) 403-8513 Member Services: 28 Vernon St, Suite 413, Brattleboro VT 05301 – (802) 275-3800 – Fax: (802) 275-3801 – <a href="https://www.ota.com">www.ota.com</a> Canada: 1145 Carling Ave, Ste 7519, Ottawa K1Z 7K4 Canada – East: (613) 482-1717 - West: (250) 335-3423 – <a href="https://www.ota-canada.ca">www.ota-canada.ca</a>