



SUMMARY OF FALL 2015 NOSB MEETING ACTIONS

The National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) held its public meeting **October 26-29** in Stowe, Vermont. View [Meeting Agenda \(PDF\)](#). Below is an at-a-glance look at final NOSB decisions on 2017 Sunset materials and petitions followed by a summary chart providing a quick overview of all NOSB discussion documents, subcommittee proposals and final decisions. Quick summaries of discussion, public comments, and votes can be found on [OTA's Twitter](#). For additional background information, READ OTA's summary of NOSB Subcommittee Recommendations and Discussion Documents.

AT-A-GLANCE – FINAL NOSB DECISIONS

PETITIONS:

PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking

- *Crops*: Petition to REMOVE **Lignin Sulfonate** from the National List as a post-harvest flotation aid
- *Handling*: Petition to REVISE the annotation on **Natural Flavors** to require organic when available

FAILED – will continue to be PROHIBITED in organic production and handling

- *Crops*: Petition to ADD **Sulfuric Acid** to the National List
- *Crops*: Petition to ADD **Brown Seaweed Extract** to the National List

TABLED - Back to Subcommittee for further review

- *Handling*: Petition to add **Sodium Lactate** and **Potassium Lactate** to the National List for use as microbial agents only

2017 SUNSET REVIEW: VOTES FOR REMOVAL ONLY - ALL OTHERS WILL BE RELISTED (SEE CHART BELOW)

REMOVE from the National List and no longer allow

- *Crops*: **Lignin Sulfonate** as a post-harvest flotation aid in organic crop production
- *Livestock*: **Furosemide** used to treat pulmonary edema and hypercalcemia in livestock
- *Handling*: Magnesium Carbonate; Whey Protein Concentrate; Chipotle Chili Peppers; Inulin (oligofructose enriched); Dillweed Oil; Chia Seed; Frozen Galangal; Frozen Lemongrass; Turkish Bay Leaves

PROPOSALS/DISCUSSION DOCUMENTS (NON-SUNSET):

PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking

- *Crops*: Proposal to change the annotation on **Micronutrients**
- *Crops*: Proposal to *classify* **Laminarin** as “non-synthetic” and allow for use in organic crop production

- *Crops and Livestock*: Proposal to modernize the annotation on **EPA List 4 Inerts**
- *Handling*: Proposal to re-classify **Alginic Acid** from ‘Non-synthetic’ to ‘Synthetic’
- *Handling*: Proposal to re-classify **Carnauba Wax** from ‘Non-synthetic’ to ‘Agricultural’
- *Materials*: Proposal to NOP to provide **guidance on prevention strategies** against **GMO contamination**
- *Materials*: Proposal to accept the **2015 Research Priorities**

TABLED - Back to Subcommittee for further review

- *Handling*: Proposal to approve charts of **Ancillary Substances** for Microorganisms, Yeast and Pectin
- *Livestock*: Discussion document to change the withholding time required by the annotation on **Lidocaine and Procaine**
- *Livestock*: Discussion document to change the withholding time required by the annotation on **Parasiticides**

SUMMARY CHART OF MOTIONS AND FINAL DECISIONS FOR ALL NOSB AGENDA ITEMS

As specified in the Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA), two-thirds of the votes cast at an NOSB meeting at which a quorum is present shall be decisive of any motion [§2119(i)]. As there were 14 NOSB members present at the meeting, 10 votes in favor were needed to pass any recommendation.

- **Non-input related proposals**: two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of the motion for the recommendation to pass
- **Petition to add or remove an input or ingredient to/from the National List**: two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of adding (or removing) the input/ingredient in order for USDA to have the authority to add or remove it from the National List
- **Sunset Review proposals**: two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of removing an input or ingredient in order for USDA to have the authority to amend the National List. If two-thirds of NOSB vote to remove and USDA accepts the recommendation, then USDA will pursue rulemaking.

NON-SUNSET MATERIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Note: Items highlighted in RED will be *removed* from the National List following NOP approval and rulemaking

Subcommittee	Agenda Item	Motion and Subcommittee Votes	FINAL VOTE: RELIST/ADD/REMOVE
Crops: Proposal (Petition)	Lignin Sulfonate	REMOVE FROM the National List at *205.601 as an allowed synthetic post-harvest flotation aid <i>(Subcommittee Vote: 5 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent)</i>	PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking Yes: 14 No: 0
Crops: Proposal (Petition)	Sulfuric Acid	ADD to the National List as an allowed synthetic in organic crop production <i>(Subcommittee Vote: 0 in favor; 5 against; 0 absent)</i>	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED Sulfuric Acid will continue to be prohibited in organic production Yes: 0 No: 14
Crops: Proposal (Petition)	Brown Seaweed Extract	ADD Brown Seaweed Extracts to the National List as an allowed synthetic in organic crop production. <i>(Subcommittee Vote: 0 in favor; 5 against; 0 absent)</i>	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED Brown Seaweed Extract will continue to be prohibited in organic production Yes: 0 No: 14

Crops: Proposal	Micronutrients	REVISE the annotation on Micronutrients (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 5 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent</i>)	PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking Yes: 12 No: 1 Abstain: 1
Crops: Proposal	Laminarin	CLASSIFY Laminarin as “non-synthetic” and allow for use in organic crop production (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 5 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent</i>)	PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking Yes: 9 No: 3 Abstain: 2
Crops and Livestock: Proposal	EPA List 4 Inerts	Proposal to MODERNIZE the annotation on Inerts from EPA List 4 to the Safer Choice Program (10 yes, 4 no) (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 5 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent</i>)	PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking Yes: 10 No: 4 Absent: 1
Handling: Proposal (Petition)	Natural Flavors	REVISE the annotation on Natural Flavors to require organic when available (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 7 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent</i>)	PASSED: Agricultural forms may be used only when organic forms are not available in quantity, quality or form. Synthetic glycerin will no longer be allowed. Yes: 14 No: 0
Handling: Proposal (Petition)	Sodium and Potassium Lactate	ADD to the National List as an allowed synthetic (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 4 in favor; 1 against; 2 abstain</i>)	TABLED – Sent back to subcommittee for further review. NOSB will revisit at spring 2016 meeting.
Handling: Proposal	Alginate Acid	RE-CLASSIFY Alginate Acid from ‘Non-synthetic’ to ‘Synthetic’ (<i>Subcommittee: 6 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent</i>)	PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking Yes: 13 No: 0 Abstain: 1
Handling: Proposal	Carnauba Wax	RE-CLASSIFY Carnauba Wax from ‘Non-synthetic’ to ‘Agricultural’ (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 6 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent</i>)	PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking Yes: 12 No: 1 Abstain: 1
Handling: Proposal	Ancillary Substances (Yeast, Microorganisms, & Pectin)	APPROVE the functional classes of ancillary substances provided in the proposal charts for pectin, yeast & microorganisms (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 7 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent</i>)	TABLED – Sent back to subcommittee for further review. NOSB will revisit at spring 2016 meeting.
Livestock: Discussion Only	Lidocaine and Procaine	DISCUSSION DOCUMENT to change the withholding time required by the annotation on Lidocaine and Procaine	BACK TO SUBCOMMITTEE FOR FURTHER WORK NOSB will revisit at spring 2016 meeting.
Livestock: Discussion Only	Parasiticides	DISCUSSION DOCUMENT to change the withholding time required by the annotation on Parasiticides	BACK TO SUBCOMMITTEE FOR FURTHER WORK NOSB will revisit at spring 2016 meeting.
Materials: Proposal	Prevention Strategy on Excluded Methods	APPROVE the proposal to NOP to issue guidance to certifiers and industry on precautions organic producers and handlers should take to prevent contact with GMOs. (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 6 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent</i>)	PASSED: will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking Yes: 13 No: 0 Abstain: 1
Materials: Proposal	2015 Research Priorities	APPROVE the proposal to accept the 2015 Research Priorities. (<i>Subcommittee Vote: 6 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent</i>)	PASSED: will be made available for the public to use to influence research projects and funding Yes: 14 No: 0

- National List References: 205.606 = allowed non-organic agricultural ingredient only when OG is not available / 205.601 = allowed synthetic crop input / 205.603 = allowed synthetic livestock input

2017 SUNSET REVIEW

Note: Items highlighted in **RED** will be *removed* from the National List following NOP approval and rulemaking. Items highlighted with an **asterisk (*)** indicate controversy or concern and potential future action by NOSB.

CROPS (7 CFR 205.601 & 205.602)

National List Item & Use	FINAL DECISION: RELIST/REMOVE
ALGICIDES, SANITIZERS, AND PEST, WEED, AND DISEASE CONTROL MATERIALS	
Alcohols (Ethanol and Isopropanol): Used to disinfect tools, growing supplies, to prevent spread of diseases.	RELIST - Ethanol (Relist: 14 Remove: 0) Isopropanol (Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Chlorine Materials (Calcium Hypochlorite, Sodium Hypochlorite, Chlorine Dioxide): Used to disinfect tools, prevent spread of diseases, and increase food safety of organic products.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Soap Based Algicide/Demossers: Used to control algae and moss build up on irrigation systems	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 5, Remove: 8, Abstain: 1)
Newspaper or other recycled paper: Used as a mulch for weed control or as a compost feedstock	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Ammonium Soaps: Used as a large animal repellent, but cannot come into contact with soil or edible portion of crops	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Ammonium Carbonate	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Boric Acid: Used for structural pest control, but cannot come into contact with organic food or crops	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Elemental Sulfur: Used for pest & disease control & as a fertilizer to correct sulfur deficiencies in soil	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Lime Sulfur: Used for pest and disease control	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
*Horticultural Oils: Used for pest and disease control Discussion: Subcommittee is looking into the annotation and whether to revise it to regulate use patterns to protect workers & arthropods.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Insecticidal Soaps: Used for pest and disease control	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sticky Traps/Barriers: Used to monitor for pest populations issues in organic fields	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sucrose octanoate esters: Used for pest control	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Pheromones: Used to confuse pests and prevent infestations	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)

Vitamin D3: Used for rodent control	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 3)
*Coppers, fixed: Used for disease control Discussion: Controversial input over the years with discussion about the annotation and whether it's effective or not. Subcommittee welcomes a petition if anyone wants to revise the annotation to improve the requirements to monitor its use.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Copper Sulfate: Used for pest and disease control and as a fertilizer to correct copper deficiencies in soil	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Hydrated Lime: Used for disease control	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Absent: 1)
Potassium Bicarbonate: Used for disease control	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 1, Absent: 1)
FERTILIZERS, SOIL AMENDMENTS, AND CROP PRODUCTION AIDS	
*Aquatic Plant Extracts: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment Discussion: NOSB indicated concerns around overharvest of seaweed for this purpose but acknowledged aquatic plant extracts are still necessary for organic production. Indicated they would be requesting an updated TR for Aquatic Plant Extracts and will be focusing on being specific around which exact species of seaweed should be allowed.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 6, Remove: 5, Abstain: 3)
Humic Acids: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 10 , Remove: 4)
*Lignin Sulfonate: Used as a chelating agent and dust suppressant in fertilizer. Discussion: NOSB expressed concerns regarding the impact lignin sulfonate has on aquatic life when used as a dust suppressant or chelating agent. The TR for this use did not indicate that it is necessary when manufacturing prilled fertilizers like pelleted gypsum or lime products, and NOSB did not discuss this use pattern during its sunset review.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 7, Remove: 7)
Lignin Sulfonate: Used as a flotation aid in post-harvest handling of organic products	REMOVE (Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Magnesium Sulfate: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Micronutrients: Used as a fertilizer when testing shows deficiencies Note: The proposal for the annotation change is separate from sunset decision.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Liquid Fish Products: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Vitamin B1, C, and E: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
*Ethylene: Used to regulate pineapple flowering	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 3, Abstain: 2)

Discussion: Organic pineapple growers, producer coops, and exporters from Costa Rica gave compelling testimony to NOSB on how necessary limited, judicious use of ethylene gas is for them to supply pineapples to foreign markets. They said that in order to harvest adequate quantities of pineapples at similar ripeness, they must first coordinate the flowering of the pineapple plants, and ethylene is the only substance available to accomplish this.	
Sodium Silicate: Used as a floatation aid in post-harvest handling of organic products	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
EPA List 4 – Inerts of Minimal Concern: Allowed in organic pest, weed, and disease control products	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Microcrystalline Cheesewax: Used to prevent undesirable fungi growth in log grown mushroom production	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
NON-SYNTHETICS PROHIBITED IN ORGANIC CROP PRODUCTION	
Ash from manure burning Sodium Fluoroaluminate Arsenic Strychnine Lead Salts Tobacco Dust (Nicotine Sulfate) Potassium Chloride	RELIST AS PROHIBITED IN ORGANIC CROP PRODUCTION (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)

LIVESTOCK (7 CFR 205.603 and 205.604)

National List Item & Use	FINAL DECISION: RELIST/REMOVE
Alcohols (Ethanol): Used as a sanitizer and disinfectant	RELIST- Ethanol (Relist: 12 Remove: 1, Abstain: 1)
Alcohols (Isopropanol): Used as a sanitizer and disinfectant	RELIST- Isopropanol (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 1, Absent: 1)
Aspirin: Used to reduce inflammation	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Absent: 1)
Atropine: Used as an antidote for livestock poisoning	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Biologics (Vaccines): Used to prevent disease	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Butorphanol: Used as an anesthetic for surgical procedures	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Chlorhexidine: Used as an antiseptic and teat dip when alternatives have lost efficacy	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Chlorine Materials (Calcium Hypochlorite, Sodium Hypochlorite, Chlorine Dioxide): Used for sanitizer and disinfectant	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)

Electrolytes: Used to replenish electrolytes in organic livestock	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Furosemide: Used to treat pulmonary edema and hypercalcemia	REMOVE (Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Glucose: Used to treat ketosis and hypoglycemia	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Glycerin: Used in livestock teat dips	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Hydrogen Peroxide: Used as a disinfectant	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Iodine: Used as a topical disinfectant and as a teat dip	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Magnesium Hydroxide: Used as an antacid and laxative	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Oxytocin: Used in post parturition therapeutic applications (e.g., retained placenta)	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Parasiticides (Fenbendazole): Used to control internal parasites in organic breeder stock and dairy animals only; emergency use only	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Parasiticides (Ivermectin): Used to control internal parasites in organic breeder stock and dairy animals only; emergency use only Discussion: NOSB discussed extensively whether to remove ivermectin as the alternatives appear to be effective. Ultimately, they decided to renew knowing that they will be considering a recommendation in the spring to amend the annotations for moxidectin and fenbendazole and could vote to remove ivermectin at that time.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 4, Remove: 6, Abstain: 4)
Parasiticides (Moxidectin): Used to control internal parasites in organic breeder stock and dairy animals only; emergency use only	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 0, Abstain: 2)
Peroxyacetic/Peracetic Acid: Used as an equipment cleaner	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Phosphoric Acid: Used as an equipment cleaner	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Poloxalene: Used as an emergency bloat treatment	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
Tolazoline: Used to reverse the effects of Xylazine after surgical procedures	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Xylazine: Used as a sedative, analgesic, and muscle relaxant	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Copper Sulfate: Used as hoof bath to treat foot conditions	RELIST

	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
Formic Acid: Used to control Varroa mites in beehives	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Lidocaine: Used as a local anesthetic	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Hydrated Lime: Used as an external parasiticide	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Mineral Oil: Used for topical treatments and as a lubricant	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Procaine: Used as a local anesthetic Discussion: NOSB discussed the long withholding times following the use of procaine and whether its use was still necessary in organic production.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 3, Abstain: 2)
Sucrose Octonate Esters: Used as an external parasiticide	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Methionine: An essential amino acid used as a feed additive Discussion: NOSB continued its discussion on methionine and heard updates from the methionine working group and NOP on developments of alternatives and timeline for rule making on modifying the annotation for methionine. An organic poultry-working group will be formed to advise NOSB on organic poultry issues moving forward.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 10, Remove: 3, Abstain: 1)
Trace Minerals and Vitamins: Used as feed additives to satisfy livestock nutritional needs	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
EPA List 4 – Inerts of Minimal Concern: Used as inert ingredients in allowed pest and disease control products	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Excipients: Used as additives to allowed livestock healthcare treatments	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 1, Abstain: 1)
NON-SYNTHETICS PROHIBITED IN ORGANIC CROP PRODUCTION	
Strychnine - WILL CONTINUE TO BE PROHIBITED IN ORGANIC LIVESTOCK PRODUCTION	RELIST AS PROHIBITED (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)

HANDLING (7 CFR 205.605 and 205.606)

NON-AGRICULTURAL (NON-SYNTHETIC) 205.605(a)	
Alginate acid: Used as a stabilizer in many products such as beverages, cheese and dressings. Also used as a defoaming agent.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 1, Abstain: 1)
Citric acid: Produced via fermentation with a carbohydrate substrate. Used to adjust the pH (acidity) of numerous organic products as well as maintain the quality and control of microorganisms.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Lactic acid: Used as an acidulant in many types of products and may be used in the brewing industry.	RELIST

	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Attapulgate: Used as a processing aid and natural bleaching clay for the purification of vegetable and animal oils.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 3)
Bentonite: Used as a filtering aid, as a thickener and as a colorant in wine.	RELIST (Vote – Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Calcium carbonate: Used as a carrier for bleaches. Also used as an alkali to reduce acidity, a neutralizer and firming agent. Used in baking powder as a neutralizer.	RELIST (Vote – Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Calcium Chloride: Firming agent for sliced apples and other fruits and in certain cheeses to aid coagulation of the milk (turns liquid into thick gel for cutting into curds).	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 0 Abstain: 2)
Dairy Cultures: Used in making yogurt, cheese, some butter, and milk-derived products such as kefir.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Diatomaceous Earth: Used for filtering numerous organic products.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Enzymes: Used in bakery products, for making cheese, juice, barley malt and many other food processing purposes. Must be derived from edible, nontoxic plants, nonpathogenic fungi, or nonpathogenic bacteria.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Natural Flavors: Nonsynthetic sources only and must not be produced using synthetic solvents/ carrier systems/artificial preservative. Used to improve the flavor of foods and beverages.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Kaolin (Clay Mineral): Used as an anticaking agent (e.g. keeps powders from caking or sticking).	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Magnesium sulfate: Nutrient supplement. Used as mineral supplements for food, leavening agents and pH control agents. Also used as a corrective in the brewing industry.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Nitrogen: Keeps cans rigid in still juice. Excludes oxygen from sealed containers. Used in flash freezing of foods. The nitrogen dissipates into the air after freezing and does not remain in the food product.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Oxygen: Modifies atmosphere.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Perlite: Used as a filtering aid especially by the juice sector.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium chloride: A yeast food used in the brewing industry to improve brewing and fermentation and in the jelling industries. Used a substitute for sodium chloride in low-sodium dietary foods.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium iodide: Used in table salt as a source of dietary iodine. It is also in some drinking water. Discussion: concerns expressed by public about the fortification of foods	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sodium bicarbonate: Baking soda. A leavening agent.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sodium carbonate: Used as a neutralizer for butter, cream, fluid milk and ice cream; in the processing of olives before canning; and in cocoa products.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Carnauba wax: Candy glaze and polish.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0 Abstain: 1)

Discussion: Concerns were expressed about the fact that there is no requirement for it to be labeled. Some NOSB members are interested in continuing to pursue a path that would require it be labeled on organic products.	
Wood resin: Used as a coating for fresh citrus fruits.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0 Abstain: 1)
Yeast: Used for flavoring, as a protein source (nutritional yeast), and various fermentation applications such as bread, wine and beer. Organic forms of yeast must be used when commercially available. Growth on petrochemical substrate and sulfite waste liquor is prohibited.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)

NON-AGRICULTURAL (SYNTHETIC) 205.605(b)	
Acidified sodium chlorite: Used as a secondary direct antimicrobial food treatment and indirect food contact surface sanitizing.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Alginates: Seaweed derivatives used as stabilizers and water retainers. Provides heat stable gels.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 2, Abstain: 1)
Ammonium bicarbonate (for use only as a leavening agent): Leavening agent, pH control & dough strengthener. Used commonly in organic crackers. Nutrient in fermentation.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Ammonium carbonate (for use only as a leavening agent): Leavening agent, pH control agent. Baking powder component.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Ascorbic acid: Preservative and antioxidant in fruits, jellies, processed meat products, and dairy products. Also a common form of Vitamin C used in many organic products. Curing or pickling agent.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Calcium citrate: Buffer / pH control.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Calcium hydroxide: Used primarily for the manufacture of organic corn tortillas and organic sugar. Does not remain in final production (processing aid).	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic): Leavening, nutrient fortification for yeast growth, and monobasic as a firming agent. Discussion: Several commenters expressed concern about the over-consumption of the phosphates in general via eating processed food. The phosphates were identified as a priority research topic.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 10, Remove: 2, Abstain: 2)
Carbon dioxide: Used in the storage of grains for pest control and for freezing of foods and accelerated cooling. Beverage carbonation. Extraction of essential oils and extracts. Controlled atmospheric packaging.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Chlorine materials (Calcium hypochlorite; Chlorine dioxide; and Sodium hypochlorite): For disinfecting and sanitizing food contact surfaces and as a sanitizer in the handling and processing of organic crops.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Ethylene: Used for postharvest ripening of tropical fruit and de-greening of citrus.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 3)

*Ferrous sulfate: Used for iron enrichment or fortification of organic baby food, flour, and animal feed. Discussion: Subcommittee will explore why the annotation is inconsistent w/ the annotation for the general listing of 'nutrient vitamins and minerals.'	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Glycerides (mono and di): Used for drum drying of food such as organic potato flakes. Prevents the potatoes from sticking to the drum. Not present in final product (processing aid).	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 8, Remove: 6)
Glycerin: Commonly used in organic baked goods and organic body care products, as an emulsifier for natural flavors.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Hydrogen peroxide: Bleaching agent/disinfectant. Effective and environmentally benign substance used to reduce/control microorganisms for food safety purposes. Critical for sanitizing of aseptic packaging.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Magnesium carbonate: Alkali used for sour cream, butter, ice cream, cacao products, and canned peas. Flow agent for salt. No longer essential therefore NOSB voted for removal.	REMOVE (Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Magnesium chloride, derived from sea water: Coagulant in tofu manufacturing. Firming agent in canned vegetables.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Magnesium stearate: Used as an excipient and flow agent. Binding agent in tablets.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
*Nutrient vitamins and minerals: Used to fortify organic food in accordance with FDA requirements. Discussion: Several commenters and NOSB members are concerned that USDA has not completed rulemaking to revise the annotation and to address several outstanding accessory nutrients. The subcommittee is considering bringing forth a proposal in the spring to address the issue. NOP weighed in and stated that they are planning to complete rulemaking in due time.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 8, Remove: 6)
Ozone: Disinfectant and fumigant. Effective and environmentally benign substance used to reduce/control microorganisms for food safety purposes.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Absent: 1)
Phosphoric acid: Cleaning of food-contact surfaces and equipment only. Used in dairy lines.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium acid tartrate: Used in many types of organic baked goods as a leavening agent. Used as part of aluminum free baking powder, along with sodium bicarbonate and cornstarch.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium carbonate: Cocoa products, (Dutch alkali process). Extractant (often in combination with potassium hydroxide). Boiler water additive.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Potassium citrate: Used as an acidulant, buffering agent and potassium source.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium phosphate: pH control in milk products. Used as a microbial nutrient (yeast food); source of mineral potassium and/or phosphorus.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 2, Abstain: 3)
Sodium citrate: An emulsifier in ice cream, cheese, and evaporated milk; a buffer to control acidity and retain carbonation in beverages.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sodium hydroxide (prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables): Caustic soda / Lye. An alkali and emulsifier. Use as a modifier for food starch, a glazing for pretzels.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)

*Sodium phosphates (for use only in dairy foods): Used as an emulsifier in organic cheese products. Discussion: Several commenters expressed concern about the over-consumption of the phosphates in general via eating processed food. The phosphates were identified as a priority research topic.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 2, Abstain: 1)
Sulfur dioxide: Allowed only in wine labeled “made with organic grapes,” Provided, That, total sulfite concentration does not exceed 100 ppm. Used to prevent spoilage of wine and to retain color.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Tocopherols: Used in numerous organic food and personal care products. One of the few antioxidants allowed in organic. Critical to the shelf life of organic products with essential oils; prevents rancidity. Discussion: Listed as synthetic, but non-synthetic forms also exist. Added to NOSB’s work plan to explore an annotation that would require non-synthetic forms when available.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 4, Abstain: 1)
Xanthan gum: Emulsifier & stabilizer thickener.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 8, Remove: 5, Abstain: 1)

AGRICULTURAL (205.606) – ORGANIC FORMS REQUIRED WHEN COMMERCIALY AVAILABLE	
Casings, from processed intestines: Used for sausage casings.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Celery Powder: Used in a variety of processed meat products to provide “cured” meat attributes without using prohibited nitrites. Discussion: Tom Chapman requested that the development of an organic alternative be prioritized. The organic industry is moving on this via OTA’s National List Innovation Working Group.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 5)
Chia (<i>Salvia hispanica L.</i>): Added to variety of food products, mostly for their omega 3 fatty acid profile and other nutrient content. Organic forms are readily available.	REMOVE (Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Dillweed Oil: Used in the manufacture of dill pickles. Comments did not indicate a need to continue its listing.	REMOVE (Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
*Fish Oil: Used as an ingredient to increase the content of omega-3 fatty acids. Discussion: NOSB debated the environmental impacts of fish oil production as well as market concerns & consumer expectations. Strong desire expressed to remove this material from the National List.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 5, Remove: 8, Abstain: 1)
Fructooligosaccharides: Used as a soluble prebiotic fiber, sweetening agent, flavor enhancer, bulking agent and humectant.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 6, Remove: 8)
Galangal, Frozen: Galangal is a rhizome in the ginger family and is used in various Asian cuisines. Comments did not indicate a need to continue its listing.	REMOVE (Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Gelatin: Used in a wide range of products as a clarification or fining agent.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 3, Abstain: 2)
Gums (Arabic, Carob Bean, Guar, Locust Bean): Used as binders and thickening agents in a very large variety of foods.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Inulin-oligofructose Enriched: Used to increase calcium bioavailability and absorption, as a soluble dietary fiber, as a non-caloric sweetener, & for functional effects on the texture/consistency of food. Comments did not indicate a need to continue its listing.	REMOVE (Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)

Kelp: Used for centuries in traditional Japanese food, kelp provides a unique flavor profile and can be used as a thickening agent or as a base for broth.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 8, Remove: 4, Abstain: 2)
Konjac flour: Used in traditional foods in Asia such as Shirataki noodles and konjac curd. It is considered a binder, gelling agent, thickener and stabilizer.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 5, Remove: 9)
*Lecithin – de-oiled: Used ingredient in food, as an emulsifier, dispersing agent, and to reduce the hydration properties of powders in water and milk products. Discussion: Organic is available however commenters expressed concern about the supply of sunflower lecithin, suitable for individuals with food allergies.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 5)
Lemongrass, frozen: The leaves are used in various Asian cuisines. Comments did not indicate a need to continue its listing.	REMOVE (Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
*Orange Pulp, dried: Used as a moisture retention agent and fat substitute in many types of products. Discussion: Subcommittee members that initially voted to remove this material were greatly influenced by the oral comments of the manufacturer. The Board ultimately decided that organic forms are not commercially available.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 7, Remove: 5, Abstain: 2)
Orange Shellac – unbleached: It is used as a coating for fruit and vegetables as well as a confectionary glaze.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
Pectin (non-amidated forms only): Used as a gelling agent in jams, preserves, fillings and other products.	RELIST (Vote – Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Peppers (Chipotle chile): Used as a flavoring to give products a distinct hot (spicy) and smoky chili flavor common in Latin foods. Organic forms are readily available.	REMOVE (Vote – Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Seaweed, Pacific Kombu: Provides a unique flavor profile and can be used as a thickening agent or as a base for broth.	RELIST (Vote – Relist: 11, Remove: 1, Abstain: 2)
Starches (Corn Starch & Sweet Potato): Used in many foods as thickeners, formulation aids, bulking agents and moisture adsorption agents.	RELIST (Vote – Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Turkish Bay Leaves: An herb that has been used traditionally to flavor food. Organic forms are available although the supply is still fragile.	REMOVE (Vote – Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Wakame Seaweed (<i>Undaria pinnatifida</i>): Edible seaweed, most often served in soups and salads.	RELIST (Vote – Relist: 12, Remove: 1, Abstain: 1)
Whey Protein Concentrate: Used in dairy products, protein bars, and infant formulas as a source of protein, as a fat replacer, and as a texturizer. Organic forms are readily available.	REMOVE (Vote – Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
COLORS	**RELIST ALL COLORS
Black/Purple Carrot -----	Vote – Remove: 2 Relist: 10 Abstain: 2
Blueberry Juice Color -----	Vote – Remove: 5 Relist: 5 Abstain: 4
Beet Juice Extract -----	Vote – Remove: 6 Relist: 6 Abstain: 2
Black Current Juice Color -----	Vote – Remove: 3 Relist: 6 Abstain: 5
Carrot Juice Color -----	Vote – Remove: 4 Relist: 7 Abstain: 3
Cherry Juice -----	Vote – Remove: 3 Relist: 9 Abstain: 2

Chokecherry (Aronia Juice Color) -----	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Elderberry -----	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Grape Juice Color -----	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Grape Skin Extract -----	Vote – Remove: 6 Relist: 6 Abstain: 2
Pumpkin Juice Color -----	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Paprika -----	Vote – Remove: 5 Relist: 7 Abstain: 2
Pumpkin -----	Vote – Remove: 2 Relist: 11 Abstain: 1
Purple Potato Juice -----	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Red Cabbage Color -----	Vote – Remove: 2 Relist: 11 Abstain: 1
Red Radish Extract Color -----	Vote – Remove: 6 Relist: 6 Abstain: 2
Saffron Extract Color -----	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Turmeric Extract Color -----	Vote – Remove: 3 Relist: 9 Abstain: 2
<i>**Note that 2/3 majority is needed to remove a material from the National List. For this meeting there were 14 members. Abstentions do not count towards the vote.</i>	

IMPORTANT: NOSB is an advisory body to the Secretary of Agriculture. NOSB recommendations are not NOP policy unless NOP issues Final rules, Final guidance, Final instructions, or a policy memorandum that adopts the NOSB recommendations. They are not part of the USDA organic regulations unless such action is taken.

Plan to attend the spring 2016 NOSB meeting! The next NOSB meeting will take place on **April 25-27, 2016**, at the Omni Shoreham Hotel in Washington, D.C. Mark your calendar, and plan to attend the networking reception OTA will be hosting. More information to come!

Organic Trade Association’s NOSB Report

As a service to its members, OTA attends National Organic Standards Board meetings. The *NOSB Report*, a member publication, summarizes the meeting and provides an overview of the agenda topics, public commentary, and key decisions made NOSB. The items included in this report represent recommendations that NOSB developed and reviewed at its meetings. If accepted by the Board, recommendations pass to the National Organic Program, which determines the final form of the NOSB recommendations. OTA members are alerted to steps in rulemaking through OTA's *News Flash* or other member communications.

OTA’s [NOSB Report archives](#) are available on OTA’s website. Please contact OTA’s Senior Director of Regulatory and Technical Affairs [Gwendolyn Wyard](#) or [Nathaniel Lewis](#), OTA’s Senior Crops and Livestock Specialist.

Headquarters: The Hall of the States, 444 N. Capitol St. NW, Suite 445-A, Washington D.C. 20001 – (202) 403-8513
Member Services: 28 Vernon St, Suite 413, Brattleboro VT 05301 – (802) 275-3800 – Fax: (802) 275-3801 – www.ota.com