It was 1997 and the National Organic Program (NOP) as we now know it was still evolving. On December 16 of that year, the first proposed rules to establish national organic standards were published by the NOP, erupting a roar of public discourse. The Department of Agriculture, which had just begun overseeing the National Organic Program, was swamped with over 275,000 public comments on the proposal, and the public interest in organic has only intensified since.

Today’s strict and comprehensive network of federal requirements and regulations that monitor and check the organic industry, from the farm gate to the dinner plate, was born out of a public outcry that started rumbling in the 1970s for a healthier and safer agricultural system that would not endanger the environment or pose risks to human health. That public sentiment culminated in the Organic Foods Production Act in the 1990 Farm Bill, which ultimately created the current rules for the entire system of certified organic agriculture in the United States.

Organic production systems encourage a healthy environment with as few inputs as possible. Organic agriculture is governed by the basic rule of allowing natural substances and not allowing synthetic materials. But in the real world, sufficient quantities of an input essential to organic production and processing — and not harmful to humans or the environment — are not always available in an organic form, so exceptions to this rule have been made. These exceptions make up the “National List of Allowed and Prohibited Substances,” or simply the “National List.”

The National List identifies the synthetic substances that may be used in organic crop and livestock production, and prohibits the use of certain natural toxic substances in organic production. The list also identifies synthetic materials such as carbon dioxide, non-synthetic non-agricultural substances such as yeast, and non-organic agricultural substances such as Turkish bay leaves that may be used in organic handling and processing.

Learn More at OTA.com/NationalList
LEARNING FROM OTHERS AND COMILING A LIST THAT WORKS

It took five years for the National Organic Standards Board (NOSB), a group of fifteen public volunteers appointed by the Secretary of Agriculture who represent various sectors of the organic industry, to complete a massive review of the inputs in use by organic producers and processors, and of state, private, and foreign organic certification programs to help craft the final organic regulations.

It was from this extensive research and engagement with everyone in the organic chain, and following thousands of comments to federal regulators, that the National List was compiled, reworked and reworked again, and then officially established on Dec. 21, 2000. The list mirrored most of the standards that organic producers and handlers were already abiding by through the various certification programs of the time, and was formulated to be flexible enough to accommodate the wide range of operations and products grown and raised in every region of the United States.

What are some of the allowable substances on the National List? For crop producers, the list includes things like newspapers for mulch and sticky traps for insect control. For livestock producers, it includes vaccines, an important part of the health regimen of an organic animal for which antibiotics are prohibited, and chlorine for disinfecting equipment. For organic processors, the list includes ingredients essential to processed products that can’t be produced organically, like baking soda, and certain vitamins and minerals and non-toxic sanitizers.

Of course, not all the allowed items on the National List are non-controversial. But all of the substances on the list are required to fulfill three critical criteria as specified by the Organic Foods Production Act: 1) Not be harmful to human health or the environment; 2) Be necessary to production because of unavailability of natural or organic alternatives, and 3) Be consistent with organic principles.

A NO-GROWTH TREND IN SYNTHETICS

The first several years of the implementation of the list were a period of fine-tuning, adjustment and just plain learning. Some materials essential to safe organic production had been overlooked and were added, like ozone gas for cleaning irrigation systems and animal enzymes for organic cheese production — both put on the list in 2003.

In 2007, the number of non-organic agricultural ingredients allowed in organic processed products was dramatically tightened. Processed products with the organic label must contain 95 percent certified organic ingredients. Before 2007, the agricultural ingredients that could be used in the remaining 5 percent category were not spelled out; ANY non-organic agricultural ingredient could be used if it was not available in organic form. In 2007, 38 specific substances were defined and added to the National List of non-organic ingredients allowed in a processed organic product. So with the addition of 38 materials to the National List, what had been an unlimited number of non-organic agricultural ingredients allowed in organic processed foods was reduced to a closed list of just several handfuls. foods was reduced to a closed list of just several handfuls.

For a decade since 2008, an even greater shift away from synthetics occurred, with just six synthetics added to the list, and a total of 77 during that same time period removed, denied from the list, or further restricted.
Allowed synthetics 2008–2018: What is the trend?

No-Growth

with a strong preference for the use and development of nonsynthetic and organic alternatives.

6 synthetics have been added

Examples of synthetics added include a sanitizer used in processing facilities that is allowed only for secondary and indirect food contact surface sanitizing, a cheese wax used for organic mushroom production, a mite control product for honeybees for organic honey production.

77 have been removed, denied, or further restricted.

Removals: 17
Petitioned and denied: 59
Further restricted: 1

The synthetics added include a sanitizer in processing facilities used only for secondary and indirect food contact, a cheese wax used for organic mushroom production, a mite control product for organic honey production, and biodegradable mulch. Substances no longer allowed in organic products or denied permission to be added include non-organic hops in organic beer, bleached lecithin, unmodified rice starch, antibiotics for pears and apples, and dozens of synthetic substances and other materials. Additional restrictions recently added include a requirement to use organic yeast in certified products for human consumption and a requirement to use organic colors.

The no-growth trend in synthetics from 2008-2018 shows a strong preference for the use and development of non-synthetic and organic alternatives.

A real-life example of a determined individual working within the NOSB system to replace an allowed synthetic material on the National List with a certified organic substitute occurred in 2013. The head of the company, which makes rice-based ingredients that food manufacturers use as alternatives to synthetic ingredients, submitted a petition in 2010 to remove silicon dioxide from the National List since his company had developed a rice-based certified organic alternative to the synthetic. In 2013, the NOSB amended the use of silicon dioxide and weighed in favor of organic rice hulls when available.
ENABLING ORGANIC TO GROW AND PRESERVING THE SYSTEM’S INTEGRITY

The system was more arduous and took longer than expected, but it worked. It was proof that the National List has the foresight to include synthetic ingredients when there are no organic or natural alternatives, and thereby enabling the organic industry to evolve and grow, but more importantly, the system provides a method to retire a synthetic substance and implement the organic alternative when it becomes available.

And in the particular case of the maker of the rice-based organic alternative, it was a win-win deal for the company, with sales growing by over 150 percent!

The National List represents a process that is rigorous, fair and one that works. It reflects realistic organic practices, while taking into account current obstacles to ideal production. It encourages public scrutiny, comment and engagement.

Organic food sales in the United States have jumped from slightly more than $18.1 billion in 2007 to nearly $50 billion in 2018. According to USDA’s National Agricultural Statistics Service’s 2016 Certified Organic Survey, the number of certified organic farms in the country totaled 14,217 farms in 2016 compared to 3,000 tops in the mid-1990s. Today, the total number of certified organic operations exceeds 26,000 nationwide.

More certified organic farmers, more organic products, more organic processors and handlers, an organic farm-to-table supply chain that is growing every day, but still adhering to a tight set of stringent guidelines—that’s what the National List has made possible.
Acting on extensive feedback and input from its members, the Organic Trade Association has filed petitions to amend the National List of Allowed and Prohibited Substances in organic production and processing.

 Removing the exemption for synthetic lignin sulfonate in post-harvest handling of organic pears

At the time of the petition (2014), there were two substances on the National List that can be used as floating agents in the handling of organic pears: lignin sulfonate and sodium silicate. As the pear industry modernized its equipment, the use of floating agents declined. The trade association contacted certified organic pear packers and found that those still using a floating agent are using sodium silicate exclusively. Thus, lignin sulfonate fails to meet the criteria that it is essential for organic production, and we petitioned that it be removed as an allowable post-harvest floating agent. In fall 2017, NOSB recommended to remove listing, and the NOP final rule to amend the National List was published on July 6, 2017.

 Strengthening the requirement for organic flavors in processed products

Natural flavors are allowed in certified organic processed foods in the 5 percent non-organic portion, provided they are produced without synthetic solvents, synthetic carriers and artificial preservatives. They must also be made without the use of genetic engineering and irradiation. Natural flavors have been included on the National List since it was first implemented in 2002. Since that time, however, many organic flavors have been developed and are being successfully used by many companies. The number of organic flavors in the marketplace has become substantial, so we petitioned (2014) to revise the current listing of natural flavors to require the use of organic flavors when they are commercially available in the necessary quality, quantity or form. In fall 2015, NOSB voted unanimously in favor of the petition, and NOP final rule to amend the National List was published December 27, 2018. The new requirement becomes effective on December 27, 2019.

 Protecting the continued production and availability of NOP certified encapsulated dietary supplements

On January 31, 2018, we submitted a petition on behalf of our National List Innovation Working Group to add pullulan to the National List as an allowed non-agricultural, non-synthetic ingredient used in tablets and capsules for dietary supplements made with organic ingredients. The need for this petition is due to a recent interpretation change to classify pullulan as “non-agricultural” instead of “agricultural.” Under the previous interpretation, pullulan was allowed in in the non-organic portion of dietary supplement labeled “made with” organic ingredients, which significantly contributed to the growth of NOP certified supplements. Under the new interpretation, pullulan would be required in certified organic form unless it is added to 205.605(a) as an allowed non-agricultural minor ingredient. Unfortunately, there are no other NOP compliant vegetarian options available for producing NOP certified vegetarian encapsulated supplements, and organic pullulan is currently not commercially available for use in the United States. Thus, if pullulan is not added to the National List, the production of NOP certified encapsulated vegetarian supplements will not be possible. The purpose of the Organic Trade Association’s petition is to protect the continued production and availability of USDA-NOP certified encapsulated dietary supplements, and to support the commercial development of certified organic pullulan. NOSB unanimously passed this petition at the spring 2019 meeting. NOP will need to implement this decision through rulemaking.

Learn More at OTA.com/National List