

# Organic Trade Association's Fall 2024 National Organic Standards Board Meeting Report

## HIGHLIGHTS, OUTCOMES, AND NEXT STEPS

On October 22-24, the National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) held its biannual public meeting in Portland, OR. NOSB meetings provide an opportunity for organic stakeholders to give input on proposed NOSB recommendations and discussion items. The meetings also allow NOSB to receive updates from USDA's National Organic Program (NOP) on issues pertaining to organic agriculture. The full agenda for the meeting, all proposals and discussion documents presented at the meeting, as well as full text of OTA's submitted written comments are available on the [OTA's NOSB Meeting Webpage](#).

### INTRODUCTIONS, UPDATES, AND PRESENTATIONS

- **Welcoming remarks and comments:** NOP Deputy Administrator Dr. Jennifer Tucker opened the fall 2024 meeting with a call to order and opening remarks, including recognition of the five Board members whose terms conclude in January 2025 and for whom this was their last public meeting. Tucker then introduced Jennifer Lester Moffitt, Under Secretary of Agriculture for Marketing and Regulatory Programs, who noted the receipt of 42 applications from individuals seeking to fill the five vacating Board seats. Announcements of appointments are expected later this fall. Lester Moffitt also provided updates on the successes of the [Transition to Organic Partnership Program \(TOPP\)](#), a \$100 million program that seeks to help farmers overcome barriers to certification and gain access to markets. To date, TOPP-funded partners have hosted 849 events, offered technical assistance to 1,600 people, and connected 700 mentoring pairs. Similar success was shared regarding the [Organic Marketing and Development Grants \(OMDG\)](#), another USDA program that has invested \$85 million to support the U.S. organic industry through 107 projects in 37 states. Opening remarks concluded with a brief address from Oregon Department of Agriculture Director Lisa Charpillouz Hanson, who highlighted the state's focus on embracing innovation, collaboration across production types, resilience in the face of climate impacts, with organic production at the forefront of some of these efforts.
- **NOSB Chair Report:** Outgoing NOSB Chair Kyla Smith shared some insights on the Board's process, noting their desire to get a large amount done, but acknowledging the need to "go slow to go fast." Smith's comment came as a reflection on agenda items that could have benefited from a bit more work before being published. While complete and meeting the intent of the respective Subcommittees' work, these items required a couple of non-substantive changes before Board members felt comfortable moving them forward. Smith also recognized feedback from stakeholders who expressed frustration with what they felt was a lack of transparency on the Subcommittee thought process on a couple of issues. Smith noted the Board could have done better to document next steps in the Subcommittee notes to provide that transparency. The comments were a notable and encouraging signal to the community of the Board's efforts at continuous improvement, and a great illustration of the democracy in action on display at public meetings and in the public process that makes this advisory board unique.
- **USDA/AMS/NOP Update:** Dr. Tucker provided the second part to the NOP's update to the Board, focused mainly on the efforts and outcomes to date of the Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE) rule, which was fully implemented in March.
  - ⇒ [Direct link to the pre-recorded Part 1 of the presentation](#)

Highlights of the in-person presentation are included below. OTA is tracking closely the following rules/topics and will continue to provide updates to

OTA members.

- **Strengthening Organic Enforcement (SOE):** Dr. Tucker highlighted the two largest parts of SOE, the reduction of exemptions to certification, and the requirement for NOP Import Certificates for all incoming organic product. SOE narrowed exemptions and now requires exporters and importers of organic product to be certified. As part of this, electronic NOP Import Certificates (NOPICs) must be generated through the USDA Organic INTEGRITY database for all organic product imported to the U.S.

Certification coverage has been critical, and Customs Brokers and U.S. Customs and Border Protection (CBP) are actively stopping uncertified product. A new “reconditioning” code is being applied by Customs Brokers to noncompliant incoming products, which is then shared with NOP for further follow up. Additionally, with the USDA organic seal now protected by a trademark, fraudulent packaged product is stopped at the border. In response to a memo issued by NOP, certifiers are strengthening their systems and increasing oversight of commodities coming from regions deemed high risk.

Dr. Tucker noted the NOP is blending education with enforcement, and shared some statistics demonstrating the impact of SOE implementation:

- 104,855 NOPICs have been issued since March 19, when SOE was fully implemented.
- 1,000 notifications have been sent to uncertified importers, resulting in a high number of importers entering into certification.
- 2,403 U.S. handling operations have been certified since January 1, a number two to three times over figures from 2023.
- Top imports include beef, coffee, soy, olive oil, bananas, and avocados, with these top commodities expected to shift with seasonality.

SOE has also brought some challenges, including an unprecedented demand for the Organic INTEGRITY database services, which has seen periodic outages as the trade requests high numbers of import certificates and standardized USDA organic certificates, both of which are generated from the database. Certifier capacity is also a critical challenge as some certifiers have struggled to keep pace with the demand of additional applicants and issuing a high number of import certificates.

- **Reconceptualizing Continuous Improvement:** Finally, Dr. Tucker touched on the concept of reconceptualizing continuous improvement, a key tenet of organic certification but one that has introduced some regulatory burdens not intended or anticipated with implementation of SOE. More regulations tend to lead to more organic system plan updates, and it turn a heavier burden on operations—often smaller businesses—to respond to these updates, and on certifiers to review these updates. Dr. Tucker challenged the audience to think about what a new, sounder and more sensible but still strong model could look like, noting “systems that grow too complex collapse.” OTA is committed to engaging in this topic and exploring ideas for improvement with our members and the organic community at large.
- **Transition to Organic Partnership Program (TOPP) Presentations:** Regional leads and project partners from the 6-state Northwest region shared updates and successes from across the area, highlighting three focus areas: pinpointed market development, direct farmer assistance, and mentoring and advice. TOPP continues to see impact in the region with 61 in-person and 13 virtual events, outreach at 58 events, and efforts to match 35 producers with mentors. The national [TOPP website](#) has further details on programs across the nation.

## NOSB MEMBERS

This 15-person citizen advisory board brings together volunteers from around the United States. It is made up of 4 farmers/growers, 2 handlers/processors, 1 retailer, 1 scientist, 3 consumer/public interest advocates, 3 environmentalists, and 1 USDA accredited certifying agent. At this meeting, 14 members were in attendance, with one joining the meeting virtually.



[Current NOSB members](#) Top (L to R): Brian Caldwell, Franklin Quarcoo, Dilip Nandwani, Gerald D'Amore, Kyla Smith (Chair), Nathan Powell-Palm, Kimberly Huseman, Nathaniel Lewis (Secretary)  
Bottom (L to R): Wood Turner, Allison Johnson, Carolyn Dimitri, Logan Petrey, Amy Bruch (Vice Chair), Mindee Jeffrey

**OFFICER ELECTIONS:** NOSB elected **Amy Bruch** as Chair, **Allison Johnson** as Vice Chair, and **Nate Lewis** as Secretary.

### MEETING OUTCOMES

**PROPOSALS:** 10 proposals were considered by NOSB, of which 9 passed and 1 was returned to subcommittee. NOSB proposals are referred to USDA for approval and implementation and do not become effective until accepted by the USDA and implemented through rulemaking.

#### **Livestock Subcommittee**

- **Petition to add Meloxicam to the National List Passed (13 yes, 1 abstain, 1 absent)** – proposal to add Meloxicam for use for treating acute pain from various veterinary procedures, enhancing the animal's welfare. As part of the vote, a non-substantive change was made to the listing recommendation to make withdrawal times and regulatory references consistent with other pain management substance listings.
- **Annotation Change – DL-methionine Passed (14 yes, 0 no, 1 absent)** – proposal to remove the annotation limiting methionine in poultry diets with rationale that limits have a negative impact on organic poultry health.
- **Annotation change – Iodine Passed (14 yes, 0 no, 1 absent)** – proposal to restrict iodine to formulations that do not contain alkylphenol ethoxylates,

which also includes nonylphenol ethoxylates (NPEs).

#### Crops Subcommittee

- **Petition to add Carbon Dioxide to the National List Passed (11 yes, 3 no, 1 absent)** – proposal to add carbon dioxide for use as a plant or soil amendment with an annotation to restrict the source of carbon dioxide to byproduct sources.
- **Compost Production for Organic Agriculture** – proposal consists of two recommendations, one for new language for the definition of compost **Passed (14 yes, 0 no, 1 absent)**, and one for composting requirements **Passed (14 yes, 0 no, 1 absent)**. As part of the discussion, a non-substantive amendment was suggested and subsequently passed to revise the recommended definition to clarify compost cannot be made solely from permitted synthetic compost feedstocks.

#### Compliance, Accreditation, Certification Subcommittee

- **Climate Induced Farming Risk and Crop Insurance Passed (14 yes, 0 no, 1 absent)** – proposal making recommendations for improvement to the USDA Risk Management Agency, along with highlighted actions that would narrow the gap between conventional and organic crop insurance options and avoid disincentivizing the transition to organic, farm diversification, and climate-smart practices.

#### Materials Subcommittee

- **Research Priorities Passed (14 yes, 0 no, 1 absent)** – proposal details the Board’s annual list of research priorities, which this year includes an effort to categorize and differentiate highest priority topics from the ongoing list. Board members expressed interest in inviting researchers in future meeting locations to present their work as it relates to research priorities to aid in raising awareness of the Board and community of work underway.
- **Inert Ingredients in Pesticide Products Passed (11 yes, 1 no, 2 abstentions, 1 absent)** – proposal concludes the Board’s consideration of a work agenda request from NOP to recommend a replacement for outdated references in the USDA organic regulations that determine the allowance of inert ingredients used in pesticide products allowed in organic production. The Board recommends two options it considers viable. A couple of Board members expressed interest in narrowing the reliance on EPA determinations as presented in the recommendation and motioned to return the proposal to subcommittee. This motion did not pass, and the proposal moved to the vote, where it passed.

#### Handling Subcommittee

- **Petition to add Potassium Phosphate to the National List Failed (0 yes, 14 no, 1 absent)** – petition requests to remove the restriction of potassium phosphate for use only in products labeled “made with organic ingredients” as well as to change the listing to “potassium phosphates” (plural), to allow for additional types of potassium phosphate in organic products. The Board expressed concern regarding negative health impacts of dietary exposure to phosphates and did not see reason to expand its use.
- **Reclassification of L-Malic Acid Motion to return to Subcommittee (11 yes, 0 no, 3 abstain, 1 absent)** – proposal recognizes the organic material review process has become more refined, and the production methods of L-malic acid have changed. The proposal notes much of the L-malic acid used in organic processing is “synthetic” while L-malic acid is currently listed at § 205.605(a) as a “nonsynthetic” substance. The proposal recommends the current nonsynthetic listing should remain but that a listing be added to § 205.60(b) so the National List accurately reflects the classification of the substance in use in organic processing. Board discussion pointed to discomfort with the potential for this determination to have impact on other National List substances and expressed the desire to better understand this potential impact. The Handling Subcommittee will resume review.

**DISCUSSION DOCUMENTS:** NOSB considered 6 discussion documents at this meeting. Once considered by the full Board, the usual process is to bring the

discussion documents back to the respective subcommittee, incorporate public comments and board discussion, and bring them to a subsequent meeting as a proposal for a full board vote.

- **Pear Ester – Petitioned (CROPS)** – addresses a petition to add pear ester to the National List at § 205.601 as a synthetic substance allowed for use in organic crop production. Pear ester has been in use in organic production as an allowed pest management tool in orchard crops (apple, pear, walnut) to control codling moth and was previously grouped with pheromones, a group of allowed synthetic substances already listed at § 205.601. However, grouping pear ester with pheromones was found to be incorrect, and the proper classification of this substance is as a kairomone, which are chemical signals produced by plants or other organisms that are detected by a distinct species, often insects. Because it has been an established pest management tool to date, and because there was confusion regarding its classification that it is not a pheromone, pear ester continues to be allowed for use as the NOSB reviews this material. Board discussion focused on whether a need exists for a broader kairomone listing, however it appears many other kairomones are nonsynthetic and would not require a broader listing. Also noted was the need for further review of the potential safety concerns with exposure to the dispensers used to emit kairomones in the field. A proposal and vote is expected at the Spring 2025 meeting.
- **Residue Testing for a Global Supply Chain (COMPLIANCE, ACCREDITATION, AND CERTIFICATION)** – continues the discussion initiated in fall 2023 to update guidance documents in the NOP Handbook pertaining to residue sampling, lab selection, the list of prohibited pesticides for NOP residue testing, responding to the testing results, and other related guidance documents. The Board’s stated goal is to aid the NOP in updating these guidance documents so residue sampling remains a critical verification tool in the certification process, and offers detailed suggestions for updates. Board discussion reflected on feedback received from the community and next steps, which include reviewing a pathway for regulatory updates to exclusions from organic sale, as well as a proposal for Spring 2025 recommending updates to NOP guidance.
- **Risk-Based Certification (COMPLIANCE, ACCREDITATION, AND CERTIFICATION)** – explores the practice of risk-based oversight and risk assessment in organic certification and whether existing resources are sufficient to support and direct certifiers and certified operations in their proficiency with risk-based oversight. The discussion document provides a gap analysis of existing resources, seeks to understand what resources are serving the organic community well, and presents several questions to stakeholders regarding risk-based practices and needs. Board discussion focused on how certification can be updated to reduce the burden on small and/or low-risk operations while also maintaining the integrity of the system. A common theme identified that certifiers are good at operating from a “one size fits all” baseline of certification and going above and beyond this when changes are implemented, such as the Strengthening Organic Enforcement rule. But certifiers are not as good at what they can do less of to minimize the burden on the small, lower-risk operations. Discussion will continue in Subcommittee with a recommendation expected at a future meeting.
- **Consistency in Organic Seed Use (COMPLIANCE, ACCREDITATION, AND CERTIFICATION)** – the Board seeks to understand the current state of organic seed use, potential tools for increasing the amount and variety of organic seed that is commercially available, and methods for strengthening enforcement of the existing commercial availability requirements. Board discussion focused on responses to a number of questions posed to stakeholders, which acknowledged the call to proceed with a previous 2018 recommendation and need for review of a 2019 recommendation. The Board also noted that the role of the handler in sourcing organic seed is needs further thought, as well as the potential need for a common source of information for seed commercial availability. Also highlighted was the need for greater input from the grower community, as these stakeholders will bear the responsibility of complying with any changes. OTA has convened an Organic Seed Task Force to respond to the Subcommittee’s questions and inform their discussion. Please [reach out](#) to join the Task Force work.

- Excluded Methods – TBD List/Induced Mutagenesis (MATERIALS)** – addresses induced mutagenesis (IM) methods used without in vitro recombinant DNA technology, and bases much of the discussion on the Technical Review that was requested specifically on IM. The Board seeks to determine whether IM should be classed as an excluded method and if so, how best to identify and restrict seeds produced using IM. Board discussion focused on the tension and balance between the use of some intensive processes with the benefit of developing genetics to be resilient to climate change and adapted to specific growing conditions. The Board expressed interest in hearing from an expert panel at a future meeting.
- Ethylene – petitioned (HANDLING)** – addresses a petition to expand the use of ethylene gas for sprout inhibition in organic potatoes and onions. Ethylene is currently allowed at § 205.605(b) for use in postharvest ripening of tropical fruit and degreening of citrus. A limited scope Technical Review has been requested and is expected for consideration during the Spring 2025 meeting cycle. Board discussion focused on gaining greater feedback from growers to understand the need for this substance, whether this need is limited solely to potatoes and onions, and whether a definition of tropical fruit is needed to aid in delineating its allowed uses.

**SUNSET REVIEWS:** NOSB voted to **renew all listings** of materials on the National List under sunset review at the meeting. See the chart below for a list.

MATERIAL (SUBCOMMITTEE)	MOTION & VOTE	OUTCOME
Atropine (LIVESTOCK) – medical treatment	To remove from §205.603(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Hydrogen peroxide (LIVESTOCK) – disinfectant	To remove from §205.603(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Iodine (LIVESTOCK) – disinfectant, topical treatment	To remove from §205.603(a), (b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Magnesium sulfate (LIVESTOCK) – medical treatment	To remove from §205.603(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Fenbendazole (LIVESTOCK) – parasiticide	To remove from §205.603(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Moxidectin (LIVESTOCK) – parasiticide	To remove from §205.603(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (LIVESTOCK) – sanitizer	To remove from §205.603(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Xylazine, Tolazoline (LIVESTOCK) – medical treatment	To remove from §205.603(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Oxalic acid dihydrate (LIVESTOCK) – parasiticide	To remove from §205.603(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
DL-methionine (LIVESTOCK) – feed additive	To remove from §205.603(d)	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.

MATERIAL (SUBCOMMITTEE)	MOTION & VOTE	OUTCOME
	<b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	
Trace minerals (LIVESTOCK) – feed additive	To remove from §205.603(d) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Vitamins (LIVESTOCK) – feed additive	To remove from §205.603(d) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Hydrogen peroxide (CROPS) – sanitizer, disinfectant	To remove from §205.601(a)(4), (i)(5) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Soaps, ammonium (CROPS) – animal repellent	To remove from §205.601(d) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Oils, horticultural (CROPS) – as insecticides (including acaricides or mite control)	To remove from §205.601(e)(7), <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Oils, horticultural (CROPS) – as plant disease control	To remove from §205.601(i)(7) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Pheromones (CROPS) – insect management	To remove from §205.601(f) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Ferric phosphate (CROPS) – slug or snail bait	To remove from §205.601(h) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Potassium bicarbonate (CROPS) – plant disease control	To remove from §205.601(i) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Magnesium sulfate (CROPS) – plant or soil amendment	To remove from §205.601(j) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Hydrogen chloride (CROPS) – for delinting cotton seed for planting	To remove from §205.601(n) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Ash from manure burning (CROPS) – nonsynthetic prohibited	To remove from §205.602 <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Sodium fluoaluminate (mined) (CROPS) – nonsynthetic prohibited	To remove from §205.602 <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Acids (Citric and Lactic) (HANDLING) – acidulant, pH control agent, flavoring, and as a sequestrant	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Calcium citrate (HANDLING) – used in dietary supplements, sequestrant, buffer, firming agent, acidity regulator	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 13 No, 2 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.

MATERIAL (SUBCOMMITTEE)	MOTION & VOTE	OUTCOME
Potassium citrate (HANDLING) – acidulants, pH controls, flavoring agents, sequestrants, buffering agent	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Sodium citrate (HANDLING) – acidulants, pH controls, flavoring agents, sequestrants, buffering agent	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Enzymes (HANDLING) – dough conditioning, flavor development, meat tenderizing	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 13 No, 2 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Microorganisms (HANDLING) – probiotics, fermentation, and bacteriophages used for food safety	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Yeast (HANDLING) – fermentation, baking, food flavors, adding nutritional value	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Hydrogen peroxide (HANDLING) – disinfectant and sanitizer	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (HANDLING) - disinfectant and sanitizer	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Celery powder (HANDLING) – meat curing	To remove from §205.606 <b>2 Yes, 11 No, 1 abstention, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Calcium chloride (HANDLING) – firming agent, flavor enhancer, pH control, stabilizer, thickener	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
L-Malic acid (HANDLING) - flavor enhancer, flavoring agent, adjuvant, and pH control	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 13 No, 2 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Magnesium sulfate (HANDLING) - firming agent, nutrient in salt-replacer products	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Perlite (HANDLING) – filter aid	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 12 No, 3 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Potassium iodide (HANDLING) – used in trace mineral supplement	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>0 Yes, 13 No, 2 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Pullulan (HANDLING) – for use in tablets and capsules for dietary supplements with a “made with organic...” claim	To remove from §205.605(a) <b>2 Yes, 12 No, 2 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List. Board members voting to remove felt the industry could meet demand
Activated charcoal (HANDLING) – filter aid	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.



MATERIAL (SUBCOMMITTEE)	MOTION & VOTE	OUTCOME
Ascorbic acid (HANDLING) – dietary supplement and nutrient, flavor ingredient	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Collagen gel (HANDLING) – casing for meat products	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Ferrous sulfate (HANDLING) – for iron enrichment of foods wthey required by regulation or recommended	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Nutrient vitamins and minerals (HANDLING) – fortification of foods	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Potassium phosphate (HANDLING) – pH control; only in products labeled “made with organic ...”	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>1 Yes, 13 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Sodium acid pyrophosphate (HANDLING) – chemical leavening agent in foods	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Tocopherols (HANDLING) – antioxidant	To remove from §205.605(b) <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Fish oil (HANDLING) – used to increase content of omfega-3-fatty acids	To remove from §205.606 <b>0 Yes, 13 No, 1 abstention, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Gelatin (HANDLING) – clarification agent, thickener, stabilizer, texturizer	To remove from §205.606 <b>0 Yes, 14 No, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Orange pulp, dried (HANDLING) – moisture retention and fat substitute	To remove from §205.606 <b>8 Yes, 5 No, 1 abstention, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List. Board members voting to remove felt there was not enough feedback to keep on the List, as well as concern with synthetic coatings and pesticides used in conventional production. Others expressed need to have more data on commercial availability
Seaweed, Pacific kombu (HANDLING) – thickening agent, flavor	To remove from §205.606 <b>0 Yes, 12 No, 2 abstentions, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.
Wakame seaweed (HANDLING) – thickening agent, flavor	To remove from §205.606 <b>0 Yes, 12 No, 2 abstentions, 1 absent.</b> Motion fails.	<b>RELIST:</b> Remains on National List.

### OTHER TOPICS AND CLOSING REMARKS

The Board closed the meeting with an overview of the [current work agenda](#) across all subcommittees. Track current and past subcommittee discussions that occur between the biannual public meetings via meeting [summary subcommittee notes](#). Bringing the meeting to a close, Dr. Jennifer Tucker and Board members offered extended and heartfelt farewells to the five outgoing members, whose term concludes in January 2025.

## **LOOKING FORWARD**

The [Spring 2025 NOSB Meeting](#) is scheduled for April 29 – May 1 in Tempe, AZ. The public comment webinars are scheduled for April 22 and 24 from Noon – 5:00 pm Eastern. Details on the meeting agenda and registration for virtual and in-person public comments will be updated on the meeting page.

***About the Organic Trade Association’s NOSB Report:*** As a service to its members, the Organic Trade Association attends NOSB meetings. The NOSB Report, a member publication, summarizes the meeting and provides an overview of the agenda topics, public commentary, and key decisions made by NOSB. The items included in this report represent recommendations that NOSB developed and reviewed at its meetings. If accepted by the Board, recommendations pass to the National Organic Program, which determines the final form of the NOSB recommendations. Our members are alerted to steps in rulemaking through our News Flash or other member communications. Archives of our NOSB Report are available on our website. Please contact [Scott Rice](#), OTA’s Senior Director, Regulatory Affairs, for more information.