

NOSB Report Fall 2015

The National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) held its public meeting October 26-29 in Stowe, Vermont. View Meeting Agenda (PDF).

Below is an overview of the introductory presentations and meeting highlights followed by an at-a-glance view and summary chart of all NOSB proposals and final decisions. A complete transcript of this meeting will eventually be posted on the <u>National Organic Program (NOP) website</u>. The final recommendations will be posted in the near future at <u>www.ams.usda.gov/NOSBMeetings</u>.

To better understand the proposals and discussion documents reported on below, read OTA's user-friendly <u>summary</u> on all meeting agenda topics. We also developed a comprehensive resource booklet in preparation for the meeting that provides additional background alongside OTA's positions. This informative booklet is available for <u>viewing as a flip book</u> or <u>downloadable as a PDF</u>. Quick summaries of discussions, public comments, and votes can also be found on OTA Twitter: https://twitter.com/organictrade.

INTRODUCTORY PRESENTATIONS

The meeting kicked off with NOSB member introductions and an address from Vermont's Secretary of Agriculture Chuck Ross. Ross emphasized that the organic movement is one of the best examples of citizen participation in the nation, with the organic sector now a \$39 billion industry with its own set of standards that proudly reflect the input of farmers across the country.

"It's easy to focus on the things that divide us rather than the things that unite us," he warned. Ross also remarked that agriculture policy often falls to the states. He extended a special thanks to OTA and its engagement with the National Association of State Departments of Agriculture (NASDA), which he said will make a difference for organic.

He was followed by a recorded welcome address by U.S. Senator Patrick Leahy. Senator Leahy opened by expressing his great appreciation for NOSB Chair Jean Richardson, and invited everyone to applaud Jean for her strong, open and thoughtful leadership.

Senator Leahy focused his address on the silver anniversary of the Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA) and the growth of the organic sector since its passage in 1990. Senator Leahy also remarked on the proliferation of informal labels such as "GMO-free," "Cage-Free," "Natural," and many others. However, he pointed out, "Only the organic label is built on a foundation of federal law and carefully considered rules and guidance, all grounded by 25 years of experience and an independent board that hears the input of producers and consumers and processors alike." He closed

by recognizing the importance of our work in maintaining the integrity of the organic label, and wished everyone a great meeting. View Senator Leahy's Presentation: Welcome Address

National Organic Program's Deputy Administrator Miles McEvoy provided an update on NOP's efforts to ensure integrity in the organic marketplace. McEvoy reviewed several NOP accomplishments, and outlined rulemaking priorities including animal welfare, aquaculture, pet food, mushrooms and apiculture. McEvoy also took considerable time to explain how complaints are filed and dealt with under NOP's compliance and enforcement authority. McEvoy's report also addressed the controversial issue of hydroponics by explaining the background and reasoning that led to AMS-NOP convening a hydroponic-aquaponic NOSB Task Force. The task force will report on the compatibility of these systems with USDA organic regulations and OFPA. McEvoy concluded by thanking everyone for contributing to the growth of organic agriculture. *View Presentation*: NOP Update (PDF)

Also, Dr. Lisa Brines, USDA's NOP National List Manager, gave a presentation and materials update on the National List. Dr. Brines reviewed the status of several petitions currently in progress and/or withdrawn, reviewed National List *materials to be discussed and voted on at this meeting, and previewed the 2018 Sunset materials that will be considered at the spring 2016 and fall 2016 NOSB meetings. *View Presentation*: Material Update (PDF) (*materials = farm/livestock inputs, ingredients, processing aids)

MEETING OVERVIEW & HIGHLIGHTS

- Public comments: Over the course of the four-day meeting, NOSB heard comments from approximately 110 members of the public on a
 number of issues. Including the public comment webinars held prior to the in-person meeting, there were 145 total commenters and 14
 hours of oral comments. NOSB discussed these and other comments of support and suggested changes from 2,955 pages of written
 comments.
- Maintaining the National List: Keeping in line with a no-growth trend to the National List since 2008, the net result from this meeting was
 the REMOVAL of 11 inputs from the National List, the DENIAL of 2 petitions to add synthetic crop inputs to the National List, and the
 APPROVAL of one petition to further restrict the use of natural flavors in organic processed products.
- **2017 Sunset Review:** The final decision was to **REMOVE** 1 crop input, 1 livestock input and 9 processing inputs (see the chart below for the complete list of sunset votes):
 - o Lignin Sulfonate as a post-harvest flotation aid in organic crop production
 - o Furosemide used to treat pulmonary edema and hypercalcemia in livestock
 - o Non-organic ingredients allowed in organic processing:
 - Synthetic: Magnesium Carbonate
 - Agricultural: Whey Protein Concentrate, Chipotle Chili Peppers, Inulin, Dillweed oil, Chia Seed, Frozen Galangal, Frozen Lemongrass, and Turkish Bay Leaves.

- Petitions to add or change National List items: NOSB discussed and voted on 5 petitions for changes to the National List:
 - o PASSED will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking
 - OTA petition to REMOVE Lignin Sulfonate from the National List as a post-harvest flotation aid in organic production
 - OTA petition to REVISE the annotation on Natural Flavors to require organic when available
 - o FAILED will continue to be PROHIBITED in organic production and handling
 - Petition to ADD Sulfuric Acid to the National List for use in organic crop production
 - Petition to ADD Brown Seed Extract to the National List for use in organic crop production
 - o TABLED Back to Subcommittee for further review (revisit at spring 2016 meeting)
 - Petition to add Sodium Lactate and Potassium Lactate to the National List for use as microbial agents only in organic meat processing
- EPA List 4 Inerts: NOSB voted 10-4 in favor of modernizing how inerts used in organic pesticide products are evaluated and approved. The change will eliminate an outdated allowance for inerts classified by EPA to be of minimal concern (EPA List 4), and, instead, indicate three mechanisms that inert ingredients can be allowed in organic pesticide products: inclusion on EPA's 25(b) inert ingredient list, review and approval by EPA's Safer Choice Program, and individual petition and NOSB review to include on the National List. The Safer Choice Program is EPA's current mechanism for reviewing substances to strict environmental and human health criteria. This recommendation will allow the collaboration between USDA and EPA to move forward, so that organic producers can continue access to their limited tools while ensuring that organic standards remain current, strict, and trustworthy.
- Ethylene Gas (for regulation of pineapple flowering): NOSB voted 9-3 (2 abstain) in favor of renewing ethylene for continued use to regulate pineapple flowering. Organic pineapple growers, producer coops, and exporters from Costa Rica gave compelling testimony to NOSB on how necessary limited and judicious use of ethylene gas is for them to supply pineapples to foreign markets. They said that in order to harvest adequate quantities of pineapples at similar ripeness, they must first coordinate the flowering of the pineapple plants, and ethylene is the only substance available to accomplish this.
- Parasiticides: NOSB weighed the continued need for three synthetic parasiticides (ivermectin, moxidectin, and fenbendazole), which are allowed for emergency use only in dairy livestock. A number of commenters indicated that ivermectin was no longer necessary because moxidectin and fenbendazole provide adequate control of parasites, and raised concerns about the toxicity of ivermectin to soil biology. Compounding the issue, however, is that both moxidectin and fenbendazole carry strict additional annotations that may undermine a producer's ability to treat their animals quickly enough if ivermectin was no longer allowed. NOSB decided to renew all three substances at this Sunset Review with the indication that a recommendation would come forth at the spring meeting to remove ivermectin and modify the annotations of moxidectin and fenbendazole, to better accommodate the realities organic livestock producers face with emergency health situations.

- Prevention Strategy for GMO Contamination: NOSB voted 13-0 (1 abstain) in favor of passing a recommendation for NOP to develop guidance on precautions that organic producers and handlers should take to prevent and minimize contact with GMOs in organic production and processing. Certified operators are already extensively carrying out such practices, but organic stakeholders and NOSB members felt it would be a stronger point in future prevention strategies and policy efforts if it were spelled out in formal guidance from USDA's National Organic Program. This recommendation is one of many critical actions NOSB is taking to keep the inadvertent introduction of GMOs out of organic livestock feed, crops and food. The Materials Subcommittee will now turn its attention back to the ongoing discussion of establishing a seed purity standard and the data needed to explore the feasibility of setting an appropriate threshold level.
- OTA Petitions for Natural Flavors and Lignin Sulfonate: NOSB unanimously voted to remove lignin sulfonate from the National List as A post-harvest flotation aid in organic production. OTA petitioned for the removal of this substance after contacting organic pear packers and finding that it is no longer being used because they have replaced it with other approved flotation substances, or have modernized their packing lines. Also unanimously approved was an OTA petition to revise the current listing of natural flavors to require the use of organic flavors when they are commercially available in the necessary quality, quantity or form. This was the first time NOSB has ever received a petition to remove a crops material from the National List. This was the sixth petition ever received to remove or further restrict an allowance on the National List for certified organic processed foods. #KeepingOrganicStrong #Success
- OTA National List Innovation Working Group & Celery Powder: In an effort to develop natural or organic alternatives to materials currently on the National List, OTA formed a National List Innovation Working Group made up of OTA members. The first project will look at the development of organically grown celery or other vegetables used in the curing of organic meat products. Celery powder is a key preservative in the curing of meats, but organic celery powder is not as effective in curing as non-organic celery powder. While organic stakeholders would like to remove non-organic celery powder from their toolbox, an appropriate alternative needs to be developed first. The OTA working group will enable and promote the development of that alternative.
- Sunset Review Process: This meeting marked the third time NOSB completed Sunset Reviews of materials following the revised Sunset procedures released by USDA in September 2014. This NOSB meeting showed the advances that have been made in organic practices that enable the use of fewer and fewer synthetic inputs, while defending the judicious use of non-organic tools where necessary. It showed that the standards for organic are transparent and constantly improving, and that the changes to the Sunset policy are working well to engage organic stakeholders and allow Board members to make the best-informed decisions they can.
- **Friendly Farmer Protest**: As with any meeting that is open to the public, there are many unscripted and unexpected moments to every NOSB meeting. This year, a handful of tractors driven by organic farmers and about 50 protestors converged at the meeting site to protest against crops grown without soil in hydroponic greenhouses being allowed to carry the organic label. These farmers were speaking out for

their beliefs and making their views heard. NOSB has established a task force to study hydroponic growing methods and report back to the Board in a year.

AT-A-GLANCE – FINAL NOSB DECISIONS

PETITIONS:

PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking

- Crops: Petition to REMOVE Lignin Sulfonate from the National List as a post-harvest flotation aid
- Handling: Petition to revise the annotation on Natural Flavors to require organic when available

FAILED - will continue to be PROHIBITED in organic production and handling

- Crops: Petition to ADD Sulfuric Acid to the National List
- Crops: Petition to ADD Brown Seaweed Extract to the National List

TABLED - Back to Subcommittee for further review

• Handling: Petition to add Sodium Lactate and Potassium Lactate to the National List for use as microbial agents only

2017 SUNSET REVIEW: VOTES FOR REMOVAL ONLY – ALL OTHERS WILL BE RELISTED (SEE CHART BELOW)

REMOVE from the National List and no longer allow

- Crops: Lignin Sulfonate as a post-harvest flotation aid in organic crop production
- Livestock: Furosemide used to treat pulmonary edema and hypercalcemia in livestock
- Handling: Synthetic: Magnesium Carbonate Agricultural:
 - Dillweed oil
 - Chia Seed
 - Chipotle Chili Peppers
 - o Frozen Galangal
 - o Frozen Lemongrass
 - o Inulin (oligofructose enriched)
 - Turkish Bay Leaves
 - Whey Protein Concentrate

PROPOSALS/DISCUSSION DOCUMENTS (NON-SUNSET):

PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP approval and rulemaking

- Crops: Proposal to change the annotation on Micronutrients
- Crops: Proposal to classify Laminarin as "non-synthetic" and allow for use in organic crop production

- Crops and Livestock: Proposal to modernize the annotation on EPA List 4 Inerts
- Handling: Proposal to re-classify Alginic Acid from 'Non-synthetic' to 'Synthetic'
- Handling: Proposal to re-classify Carnauba Wax from 'Non-synthetic' to 'Agricultural'
- Materials: Proposal to NOP to provide guidance on prevention strategies against GMO contamination
- Materials: Proposal to accept the 2015 Research Priorities

TABLED - Back to Subcommittee for further review

- Handling: Proposal to approve charts of **Ancillary Substances** for Microorganisms, Yeast and Pectin
- Livestock: Discussion document to change the withholding time required by the annotation on Lidocaine and Procaine
- Livestock: Discussion document to change the withholding time required by the annotation on **Parasiticides**

SUMMARY CHART OF MOTIONS AND FINAL DECISIONS FOR ALL NOSB AGENDA ITEMS

As specified in the Organic Foods Production Act (OFPA), two-thirds of the votes cast at an NOSB meeting at which a quorum is present shall be decisive of any motion [§2119(i)]. As there were **14 NOSB members** present at the meeting, 10 votes in favor were needed to pass any recommendation.

- Non-input related proposals: two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of the motion for the recommendation to pass
- **Petition to <u>add</u> or <u>remove</u> an input or ingredient to/from the National List:** two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of adding (or removing) the input/ingredient in order for USDA to have the authority to add or remove it from the National List
- **Sunset Review proposals:** two-thirds of NOSB members must vote in favor of <u>removing an input or ingredient</u> for USDA to have the authority to amend the National List. If two-thirds of NOSB vote to remove and USDA accepts the recommendation, then USDA will pursue rulemaking.

NON-SUNSET MATERIAL AGENDA ITEMS

Note: Items highlighted in RED will be *removed* from the National List following NOP approval and rulemaking

Subcommittee	Agenda Item	Motion and Subcommittee Votes	FINAL VOTE: RELIST/ADD/REMOVE
Crops:	Lignin Sulfonate	REMOVE FROM the National List at *205.601 as an	PASSED – will be FINALIZED following NOP
Proposal		allowed synthetic post-harvest flotation aid	approval and rulemaking
(Petition)		(Subcommittee Vote: 5 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent)	
			Yes: 14 No: 0
Crops:	Sulfuric Acid	ADD to the National List as an allowed synthetic in	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED
Proposal		organic crop production	Sulfuric Acid will continue to be prohibited in
(Petition)		(Subcommittee Vote: 0 in favor; 5 against; 0 absent)	organic production

			Yes: 0 No: 14
Crops:	Brown Seaweed Extract	ADD Brown Seaweed Extracts to the National List as	FAILED – WILL NOT BE ADDED
Proposal		an allowed synthetic in organic crop production.	Brown Seaweed Extract will continue to be
(Petition)		(Subcommittee Vote: 0 in favor; 5 against; 0 absent)	prohibited in organic production
			Yes: 0 No: 14
Crops:	Micronutrients	REVISE the annotation on Micronutrients	PASSED— will be FINALIZED following NOP
Proposal		(Subcommittee Vote: 5 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent)	approval and rulemaking
			Yes: 12 No: 1 Abstain: 1
Crops:	Laminarin	CLASSIFY Laminarin as "non-synthetic" and allow for	PASSED— will be FINALIZED following NOP
Proposal		use in organic crop production	approval and rulemaking
		(Subcommittee Vote: 5 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent)	Yes: 9 No: 3 Abstain: 2
Crops and	EPA List 4 Inerts	Proposal to MODERNIZE the annotation on Inerts	PASSED— will be FINALIZED following NOP
Livestock:		from EPA List 4 to the Safer Choice Program (10 yes, 4	approval and rulemaking
Proposal		no)	Yes: 10 No: 4 Absent: 1
		(Subcommittee Vote: 5 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent)	
Handling:	Natural Flavors	REVISE the annotation on Natural Flavors to require	PASSED: Agricultural forms may be used only
Proposal		organic when available	when organic forms are not available in
(Petition)		(Subcommittee Vote: 7 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent)	quantity, quality or form. Synthetic glycerin will
			no longer be allowed.
			Yes: 14 No: 0
Handling:	Sodium and Potassium	ADD to the National List as an allowed synthetic	TABLED – Sent back to subcommittee for
Proposal	Lactate	(Subcommittee Vote: 4 in favor; 1 against; 2 abstain)	further review. NOSB will revisit at spring 2016
(Petition)			meeting.
Handling:	Alginic Acid	RE-CLASSIFY Alginic Acid from 'Non-synthetic' to	PASSED— will be FINALIZED following NOP
Proposal		'Synthetic' (Subcommittee: 6 in favor; 0 against; 1	approval and rulemaking
		absent)	Yes: 13 No: 0 Abstain: 1
Handling:	Carnauba Wax	RE-CLASSIFY Carnauba Wax from 'Non-synthetic' to	PASSED— will be FINALIZED following NOP
Proposal		'Agricultural'	approval and rulemaking
•		(Subcommittee Vote: 6 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent)	Yes: 12 No: 1 Abstain: 1
Handling:	Ancillary Substances	APPROVE the functional classes of ancillary	TABLED – Sent back to subcommittee for
Proposal	(Yeast, Microorganisms,	substances provided in the proposal charts for pectin,	further review. NOSB will revisit at spring 2016
-	& Pectin)	yeast & microorganisms	meeting.

		(Subcommittee Vote: 7 in favor; 0 against; 0 absent)	
Livestock:	Lidocaine and Procaine	DISCUSSION DOCUMENT to change the withholding	BACK TO SUBCOMMITTEE FOR FURTHER WORK
Discussion Only		time required by the annotation on Lidocaine and	NOSB will revisit at spring 2016 meeting.
		Procaine	
Livestock:	Parasiticides	DISCUSSION DOCUMENT to change the withholding	BACK TO SUBCOMMITTEE FOR FURTHER WORK
Discussion Only		time required by the annotation on Parasiticides	NOSB will revisit at spring 2016 meeting.
Materials:	Prevention Strategy on	APPROVE the proposal to NOP to issue guidance to	PASSED: will be FINALIZED following NOP
Proposal	Excluded Methods	certifiers and industry on precautions organic	approval and rulemaking
		producers and handlers should take to prevent	Yes: 13 No: 0 Abstain: 1
		contact with GMOs.	
		(Subcommittee Vote: 6 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent)	
Materials:	2015 Research Priorities	APPROVE the proposal to accept the 2015 Research	PASSED: will be made available for the public to
Proposal		Priorities.	use to influence research projects and funding
		(Subcommittee Vote: 6 in favor; 0 against; 1 absent)	Yes: 14 No: 0

[•] National List References: 205.606 = allowed non-organic agricultural ingredient only when OG is not available / 205.601 = allowed synthetic crop input / 205.603 = allowed synthetic livestock input

2017 SUNSET REVIEW

Note: Items highlighted in RED will be *removed* from the National List following NOP approval and rulemaking. Items highlighted with an **asterisk (*)** indicate controversy or concern and potential future action by NOSB.

CROPS (7 CFR 205.601 & 205.602)

National List Item & Use	FINAL DECISION: RELIST/REMOVE
ALGICIDES, SANITIZERS, AND PEST, WEED, AND DISEASE CONTROL MATERIALS	
Alcohols (Ethanol and Isopropanol): Used to disinfect tools, growing supplies, to prevent spread of	RELIST - Ethanol (Relist: 14 Remove: 0)
diseases.	Isopropanol (Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Chlorine Materials (Calcium Hypochlorite, Sodium Hypochlorite, Chlorine Dioxide): Used to disinfect	RELIST
tools, prevent spread of diseases, and increase food safety of organic products.	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Soap Based Algicide/Demossers: Used to control algae and moss build up on irrigation systems	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 5, Remove: 8, Abstain: 1)
Newspaper or other recycled paper: Used as a mulch for weed control or as a compost feedstock	RELIST

	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Ammonium Soaps: Used as a large animal repellant, but cannot come into contact with soil or edible	RELIST
portion of crops	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Ammonium Carbonate	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Boric Acid: Used for structural pest control, but cannot come into contact with organic food or crops	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Elemental Sulfur: Used for pest & disease control & as a fertilizer to correct sulfur deficiencies in soil	RELIST
F 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Lime Sulfur: Used for pest and disease control	RELIST
and the property of the proper	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
*Horticultural Oils: Used for pest and disease control	RELIST
Discussion : Subcommittee is looking into the annotation and whether to revise it to regulate use	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
patterns to protect workers & arthropods.	,
Insecticidal Soaps: Used for pest and disease control	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sticky Traps/Barriers: Used to monitor for pest populations issues in organic fields	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sucrose octanoate esters: Used for pest control	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Pheromones: Used to confuse pests and prevent infestations	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Vitamin D3: Used for rodent control	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 3)
*Coppers, fixed: Used for disease control	RELIST
Discussion: Controversial input over the years with discussion about the annotation and whether it's	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
effective or not. Subcommittee welcomes a petition if anyone wants to revise the annotation to	
improve the requirements to monitor its use.	
Copper Sulfate: Used for pest and disease control and as a fertilizer to correct copper deficiencies in	RELIST
soil	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Hydrated Lime: Used for disease control	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Absent: 1)
Potassium Bicarbonate: Used for disease control	RELIST

	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 1, Absent: 1)
FERTILIZERS, SOIL AMENDMENTS, AND CROP PRODUCTION AIDS	
*Aquatic Plant Extracts: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST
Discussion: NOSB indicated concerns around over-harvest of seaweed for this purpose but	(Vote - Relist: 6, Remove: 5, Abstain: 3)
acknowledged aquatic plant extracts are still necessary for organic production. Indicated they would	
be requesting an updated TR for Aquatic Plant Extracts and will be focusing on being specific around	
which exact species of seaweed should be allowed.	
Humic Acids: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 10 , Remove: 4)
*Lignin Sulfonate: Used as a chelating agent and dust suppressant in fertilizer.	RELIST
Discussion: NOSB expressed concerns regarding the impact lignin sulfonate has on aquatic life when	(Vote - Relist: 7, Remove: 7)
used as a dust suppressant or chelating agent. The TR for this use did not indicate that it is necessary	
when manufacturing prilled fertilizers like pelleted gypsum or lime products, and NOSB did not	
discuss this use pattern during its sunset review.	
Lignin Sulfonate: Used as a flotation aid in post-harvest handling of organic products	REMOVE
	(Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Magnesium Sulfate: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Micronutrients: Used as a fertilizer when testing shows deficiencies	RELIST
Note: The proposal for the annotation change is separate from sunset decision.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Liquid Fish Products: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Vitamin B1, C, and E: Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
*Ethylene: Used to regulate pineapple flowering	RELIST
Discussion: Organic pineapple growers, producer coops, and exporters from Costa Rica gave	(Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 3, Abstain: 2)
compelling testimony to NOSB on how necessary limited, judicious use of ethylene gas is for them to	
supply pineapples to foreign markets. They said that in order to harvest adequate quantities of	
pineapples at similar ripeness, they must first coordinate the flowering of the pineapple plants, and	
ethylene is the only substance available to accomplish this.	
Sodium Silicate: Used as a floatation aid in post-harvest handling of organic products	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
EPA List 4 – Inerts of Minimal Concern: Allowed in organic pest, weed, and disease control products	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)

Microcrystalline Cheesewax: Used to prevent undesirable fungi growth in log grown mushroom production		RELIST (Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)	
NON-SYNTHETICS PROHIBITED IN ORGANIC CROP PRODUCTION			
Ash from manure burning	Sodium Fluoroaluminate	RELIST AS PROHIBITED IN ORGANIC	
Arsenic	Strychnine	CROP PRODUCTION	
Lead Salts	Tobacco Dust (Nicotine Sulfate)	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)	
Potassium Chloride			

LIVESTOCK (7 CFR 205.603 and 205.604)

National List Item & Use	FINAL DECISION: RELIST/REMOVE
Alcohols (Ethanol): Used as a sanitizer and disinfectant	RELIST- Ethanol
	(Relist: 12 Remove: 1, Abstain: 1)
Alcohols (Isopropanol): Used as a sanitizer and disinfectant	RELIST- Isopropanol
	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 1, Absent: 1)
Aspirin: Used to reduce inflammation	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Absent: 1)
Atropine: Used as an antidote for livestock poisoning	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Biologics (Vaccines): Used to prevent disease	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Butorphanol: Used as an anesthetic for surgical procedures	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Chlorhexidine: Used as an antiseptic and teat dip when alternatives have lost efficacy	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Chlorine Materials (Calcium Hypochlorite, Sodium Hypochlorite, Chlorine Dioxide): Used for	RELIST
sanitizer and disinfectant	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Electrolytes: Used to replenish electrolytes in organic livestock	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Furosemide: Used to treat pulmonary edema and hypercalcemia	REMOVE
	(Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Glucose: Used to treat ketosis and hypoglycemia	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)

Glycerin: Used in livestock teat dips	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Hydrogen Peroxide: Used as a disinfectant	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Iodine: Used as a topical disinfectant and as a teat dip	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Magnesium Hydroxide: Used as an antacid and laxative	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Oxytocin: Used in post parturition therapeutic applications (e.g., retained placenta)	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Parasiticides (Fenbendazole): Used to control internal parasites in organic breeder stock and dairy	RELIST
animals only; emergency use only	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Parasiticides (Ivermectin): Used to control internal parasites in organic breeder stock and dairy	RELIST
animals only; emergency use only	(Vote - Relist: 4, Remove: 6, Abstain: 4)
Discussion: NOSB discussed extensively whether to remove ivermectin as the alternatives appear to	
be effective. Ultimately, they decided to renew knowing that they will be considering a	
recommendation in the spring to amend the annotations for moxidectin and fenbendazole and could	
vote to remove ivermectin at that time.	
Parasiticides (Moxidectin): Used to control internal parasites in organic breeder stock and dairy	RELIST
animals only; emergency use only	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 0, Abstain: 2)
Peroxyacetic/Peracetic Acid: Used as an equipment cleaner	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Phosphoric Acid: Used as an equipment cleaner	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Poloxalene: Used as an emergency bloat treatment	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
Tolazoline: Used to reverse the effects of Xylazine after surgical procedures	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Xylazine: Used as a sedative, analgesic, and muscle relaxant	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Copper Sulfate: Used as hoof bath to treat foot conditions	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
Formic Acid: Used to control Varroa mites in beehives	RELIST

	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Lidocaine: Used as a local anesthetic	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Hydrated Lime: Used as an external parasiticide	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Mineral Oil: Used for topical treatments and as a lubricant	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Procaine: Used as a local anesthetic	RELIST
Discussion: NOSB discussed the long withholding times following the use of procaine and whether its	(Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 3, Abstain: 2)
use was still necessary in organic production.	
Sucrose Octonoate Esters: Used as an external parasiticide	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Methionine: An essential amino acid used as a feed additive	RELIST
Discussion: NOSB continued its discussion on methionine and heard updates from the methionine	(Vote - Relist: 10, Remove: 3, Abstain: 1)
working group and NOP on developments of alternatives and timeline for rule making on modifying	
the annotation for methionine. An organic poultry-working group will be formed to advise NOSB on	
organic poultry issues moving forward.	
Trace Minerals and Vitamins: Used as feed additives to satisfy livestock nutritional needs	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
EPA List 4 – Inerts of Minimal Concern: Used as inert ingredients in allowed pest and disease control	RELIST
products	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Excipients: Used as additives to allowed livestock healthcare treatments	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 1, Abstain: 1)
NON-SYNTHETICS PROHIBITED IN ORGANIC CROP PRODUCTION	
Strychnine - WILL CONTINUE TO BE PROHIBITED IN ORGANIC LIVESTOCK PRODUCTION	RELIST AS PROHIBITED
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)

HANDLING (7 CFR 205.605 and 205.606)

	·	
NON-AGRICULTURAL (NON-SYNTHETIC) 205.605(a)		
	Alginic acid: Used as a stabilizer in many products such as beverages, cheese and dressings. Also used	RELIST
	as a defoaming agent.	(Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 1, Abstain: 1)
	Citric acid: Produced via fermentation with a carbohydrate substrate. Used to adjust the pH (acidity)	RELIST
	of numerous organic products as well as maintain the quality and control of microorganisms.	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)

Lactic acid: Used as an acidulant in many types of products and may be used in the brewing industry.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Attapulgite: Used as a processing aid and natural bleaching clay for the purification of vegetable and	RELIST
animal oils.	(Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 3)
Bentonite: Used as a filtering aid, as a thickener and as a colorant in wine.	RELIST
	(Vote – Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Calcium carbonate: Used as a carrier for bleaches. Also used as an alkali to reduce acidity, a	RELIST
neutralizer and firming agent. Used in baking powder as a neutralizer.	(Vote – Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Calcium Chloride: Firming agent for sliced apples and other fruits and in certain cheeses to aid	RELIST
coagulation of the milk (turns liquid into thick gel for cutting into curds).	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 0 Abstain: 2)
Dairy Cultures: Used in making yogurt, cheese, some butter, and milk-derived products such as kefir.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Diatomaceous Earth: Used for filtering numerous organic products.	RELIST (Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Enzymes: Used in bakery products, for making cheese, juice, barley malt and many other food	RELIST
processing purposes. Must be derived from edible, nontoxic plants, nonpathogenic fungi, or	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
nonpathogenic bacteria.	
Natural Flavors: Nonsynthetic sources only and must not be produced using synthetic solvents/	RELIST
carrier systems/artificial preservative. Used to improve the flavor of foods and beverages.	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Kaolin (Clay Mineral): Used as an anticaking agent (e.g. keeps powders from caking or sticking).	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Magnesium sulfate: Nutrient supplement. Used as mineral supplements for food, leavening agents	RELIST
and pH control agents. Also used as a corrective in the brewing industry.	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Nitrogen: Keeps cans rigid in still juice. Excludes oxygen from sealed containers. Used in flash freezing	RELIST
of foods. The nitrogen dissipates into the air after freezing and does not remain in the food product.	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Oxygen: Modifies atmosphere.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Perlite: Used as a filtering aid especially by the juice sector.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium chloride: A yeast food used in the brewing industry to improve brewing and fermentation	RELIST
and in the jelling industries. Used a substitute for sodium chloride in low-sodium dietary foods.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium iodide: Used in table salt as a source of dietary iodine. It is also in some drinking water.	RELIST
Discussion: concerns expressed by public about the fortification of foods	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sodium bicarbonate: Baking soda. A leavening agent.	RELIST

	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sodium carbonate: Used as a neutralizer for butter, cream, fluid milk and ice cream; in the processing	RELIST
of olives before canning; and in cocoa products.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Carnauba wax: Candy glaze and polish.	RELIST
Discussion: Concerns were expressed about the fact that there is no requirement for it to be labeled.	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0 Abstain: 1)
Some NOSB members are interested in continuing to pursue a path that would require it be labeled	
on organic products.	
Wood resin: Used as a coating for fresh citrus fruits.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0 Abstain: 1)
Yeast: Used for flavoring, as a protein source (nutritional yeast), and various fermentation	RELIST
applications such as bread, wine and beer. Organic forms of yeast must be used when commercially	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
available. Growth on petrochemical substrate and sulfite waste liquor is prohibited.	

NON-AGRICULTURAL (SYNTHETIC) 205.605(b)	
Acidified sodium chlorite: Used as a secondary direct antimicrobial food treatment and indirect food	RELIST
contact surface sanitizing.	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Alginates: Seaweed derivatives used as stabilizers and water retainers. Provides heat stable gels.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 2, Abstain: 1)
Ammonium bicarbonate (for use only as a leavening agent): Leavening agent, pH control & dough	RELIST
strengthener. Used commonly in organic crackers. Nutrient in fermentation.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Ammonium carbonate (for use only as a leavening agent): Leavening agent, pH control agent. Baking	RELIST
powder component.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Ascorbic acid: Preservative and antioxidant in fruits, jellies, processed meat products, and dairy	RELIST
products. Also a common form of Vitamin C used in many organic products. Curing or pickling agent.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Calcium citrate: Buffer / pH control.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Calcium hydroxide: Used primarily for the manufacture of organic corn tortillas and organic sugar.	RELIST
Does not remain in final production (processing aid).	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic): Leavening, nutrient fortification for yeast	RELIST
growth, and monobasic as a firming agent.	(Vote - Relist: 10, Remove: 2, Abstain: 2)
Discussion: Several commenters expressed concern about the over-consumption of the phosphates	
in general via eating processed food. The phosphates were identified as a priority research topic.	
Carbon dioxide: Used in the storage of grains for pest control and for freezing of foods and	RELIST

accelerated cooling. Beverage carbonation. Extraction of essential oils and extracts. Controlled	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
atmospheric packaging.	(Vote - Nellst. 14, Nelliove. 0)
Chlorine materials (Calcium hypochlorite; Chlorine dioxide; and Sodium hypochlorite): For	RELIST
disinfecting and sanitizing food contact surfaces and as a sanitizer in the handling and processing of	(Vote - Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
organic crops.	(Vote Relist. 12, Reliiove. 2)
Ethylene: Used for postharvest ripening of tropical fruit and de-greening of citrus.	RELIST
carrylene. Oscaror postnarvest ripering or tropical trait and de greening or citrus.	(Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 3)
*Ferrous sulfate: Used for iron enrichment or fortification of organic baby food, flour, and animal	RELIST
feed. Discussion: Subcommittee will explore why the annotation is inconsistent w/ the annotation for	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
the general listing of 'nutrient vitamins and minerals.'	(**************************************
Glycerides (mono and di): Used for drum drying of food such as organic potato flakes. Prevents the	RELIST
potatoes from sticking to the drum. Not present in final product (processing aid).	(Vote - Relist: 8, Remove: 6)
Glycerin: Commonly used in organic baked goods and organic body care products, as an emulsifier for	RELIST
natural flavors.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Hydrogen peroxide: Bleaching agent/disinfectant. Effective and environmentally benign substance	RELIST
used to reduce/control microorganisms for food safety purposes. Critical for sanitizing of aseptic	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
packaging.	
Magnesium carbonate: Alkali used for sour cream, butter, ice cream, cacao products, and canned	REMOVE
peas. Flow agent for salt. No longer essential therefore NOSB voted for removal.	(Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Magnesium chloride, derived from sea water: Coagulant in tofu manufacturing. Firming agent in	RELIST
canned vegetables.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Magnesium stearate: Used as an excipient and flow agent. Binding agent in tablets.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
*Nutrient vitamins and minerals: Used to fortify organic food in accordance with FDA requirements.	RELIST
Discussion: Several commenters and NOSB members are concerned that USDA has not completed	(Vote - Relist: 8, Remove: 6)
rulemaking to revise the annotation and to address several outstanding accessory nutrients. The	
subcommittee is considering bringing forth a proposal in the spring to address the issue. NOP	
weighed in and stated that they are planning to complete rulemaking in due time.	
Ozone: Disinfectant and fumigant. Effective and environmentally benign substance used to	RELIST
reduce/control microorganisms for food safety purposes.	(Vote - Relist: 13, Absent: 1)
Phosphoric acid: Cleaning of food-contact surfaces and equipment only. Used in dairy lines.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium acid tartrate: Used in many types of organic baked goods as a leavening agent. Used as	RELIST

part of aluminum free baking powder, along with sodium bicarbonate and cornstarch.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium carbonate: Cocoa products, (Dutch alkali process). Extractant (often in combination with	RELIST
potassium hydroxide). Boiler water additive.	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 1)
Potassium citrate: Used as an acidulant, buffering agent and potassium source.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Potassium phosphate: pH control in milk products. Used as a microbial nutrient (yeast food); source	RELIST
of mineral potassium and/or phosphorus.	(Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 2, Abstain: 3)
Sodium citrate: An emulsifier in ice cream, cheese, and evaporated milk; a buffer to control acidity	RELIST
and retain carbonation in beverages.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Sodium hydroxide (prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables): Caustic soda / Lye. An	RELIST
alkali and emulsifier. Use as a modifier for food starch, a glazing for pretzels.	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
*Sodium phosphates (for use only in dairy foods): Used as an emulsifier in organic cheese products.	RELIST
Discussion: Several commenters expressed concern about the over-consumption of the phosphates	(Vote - Relist: 11, Remove: 2, Abstain: 1)
in general via eating processed food. The phosphates were identified as a priority research topic.	
Sulfur dioxide : Allowed only in wine labeled "made with organic grapes," Provided, That, total sulfite	RELIST
concentration does not exceed 100 ppm. Used to prevent spoilage of wine and to retain color.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
*Tocopherols: Used in numerous organic food and personal care products. One of the few	RELIST
antioxidants allowed in organic. Critical to the shelf life of organic products with essential oils;	(Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 4, Abstain: 1)
prevents rancidity. Discussion: Listed as synthetic, but non-synthetic forms also exist. Added to	
NOSB's work plan to explore an annotation that would require non-synthetic forms when available.	
Xanthan gum: Emulsifier & stabilizer thickener.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 8, Remove: 5, Abstain: 1)

AGRICULTURAL (205.606) – ORGANIC FORMS REQUIRED WHEN COMMERCIALLY AVAILABLE		
Casings, from processed intestines: Used for sausage casings.	RELIST	
	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)	
*Celery Powder: Used in a variety of processed meat products to provide "cured" meat attributes	RELIST	
without using prohibited nitrites. Discussion: Tom Chapman requested that the development of an	(Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 5)	
organic alternative be prioritized. The organic industry is moving on this via OTA's National List		
Innovation Working Group.		
Chia (Salvia hispanica L.): Added to variety of food products, mostly for their omega 3 fatty acid	REMOVE	
profile and other nutrient content. Organic forms are readily available.	(Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)	
Dillweed Oil: Used in the manufacture of dill pickles. Comments did not indicate a need to continue	REMOVE	

its listing.	(Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
*Fish Oil: Used as an ingredient to increase the content of omega-3 fatty acids. Discussion: NOSB	RELIST
debated the environmental impacts of fish oil production as well as market concerns & consumer	(Vote - Relist: 5, Remove: 8, Abstain: 1)
expectations. Strong desire expressed to remove this material from the National List.	
Fructooligosaccharides: Used as a soluble prebiotic fiber, sweetening agent, flavor enhancer, bulking	RELIST
agent and humectant.	(Vote - Relist: 6, Remove: 8)
Galangal, Frozen: Galangal is a rhizome in the ginger family and is used in various Asian cuisines.	REMOVE
Comments did not indicate a need to continue its listing.	(Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Gelatin: Used in a wide range of products as a clarification or fining agent.	RELIST
	(Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 3, Abstain: 2)
Gums (Arabic, Carob Bean, Guar, Locust Bean): Used as binders and thickening agents in a very large	RELIST
variety of foods.	(Vote - Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Inulin-oligofructose Enriched: Used to increase calcium bioavailability and absorption, as a soluble	REMOVE
dietary fiber, as a non-caloric sweetener, & for functional effects on the texture/consistency of food.	(Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Comments did not indicate a need to continue its listing.	
Kelp: Used for centuries in traditional Japanese food, kelp provides a unique flavor profile and can be	RELIST
used as a thickening agent or as a base for broth.	(Vote - Relist: 8, Remove: 4, Abstain: 2)
Konjac flour: Used in traditional foods in Asia such as Shirataki noodles and konjac curd. It is	RELIST
considered a binder, gelling agent, thickener and stabilizer.	(Vote - Relist: 5, Remove: 9)
*Lecithin – de-oiled: Used ingredient in food, as an emulsifier, dispersing agent, and to reduce the	RELIST
hydration properties of powders in water and milk products.	(Vote - Relist: 9, Remove: 5)
Discussion: Organic is available however commenters expressed concern about the supply of	
sunflower lecithin, suitable for individuals with food allergies.	
Lemongrass, frozen: The leaves are used in various Asian cuisines. Comments did not indicate a need	REMOVE
to continue its listing.	(Vote - Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
*Orange Pulp, dried: Used as a moisture retention agent and fat substitute in many types of	RELIST
products. Discussion: Subcommittee members that initially voted to remove this material were	(Vote - Relist: 7, Remove: 5, Abstain: 2)
greatly influenced by the oral comments of the manufacturer. The Board ultimately decided that	
organic forms are not commercially available.	
Orange Shellac – unbleached: It is used as a coating for fruit and vegetables as well as a confectionary	RELIST
glaze.	(Vote - Relist: 13, Remove: 0, Abstain: 1)
Pectin (non-amidated forms only): Used as a gelling agent in jams, preserves, and other products.	RELIST (Vote – Relist: 14, Remove: 0)
Peppers (Chipotle chile): Used as a flavoring to give products a distinct hot (spicy) and smoky chili	REMOVE

flavor common in Latin foods. Organic forms are readily available.	(Vote – Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Seaweed, Pacific Kombu: Provides a unique flavor profile and can be used as a thickening agent or as	RELIST
a base for broth.	(Vote – Relist: 11, Remove: 1, Abstain: 2)
Starches (Corn Starch & Sweet Potato): Used in many foods as thickeners, formulation aids, bulking	RELIST
agents and moisture adsorption agents.	(Vote – Relist: 12, Remove: 2)
Turkish Bay Leaves: An herb that has been used traditionally to flavor food. Organic forms are	REMOVE
available although the supply is still fragile.	(Vote – Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
Wakame Seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida): Edible seaweed, most often served in soups and salads.	RELIST
	(Vote – Relist: 12, Remove: 1, Abstain: 1)
Whey Protein Concentrate: Used in dairy products, protein bars, and infant formulas as a source of	REMOVE
protein, as a fat replacer, and as a texturizer. Organic forms are readily available.	(Vote – Relist: 0, Remove: 14)
COLORS	**RELIST ALL COLORS
Black/Purple Carrot	Vote – Remove: 2 Relist: 10 Abstain: 2
Blueberry Juice Color	Vote – Remove: 5 Relist: 5 Abstain: 4
Beet Juice Extract	Vote – Remove: 6 Relist: 6 Abstain: 2
Black Current Juice Color	Vote – Remove: 3 Relist: 6 Abstain: 5
Carrot Juice Color	Vote – Remove: 4 Relist: 7 Abstain: 3
Cherry Juice	Vote – Remove: 3 Relist: 9 Abstain: 2
Chokecherry (Aronia Juice Color)	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Elderberry	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Grape Juice Color	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Grape Skin Extract	Vote – Remove: 6 Relist: 6 Abstain: 2
Pumpkin Juice Color	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Paprika	Vote – Remove: 5 Relist: 7 Abstain: 2
Pumpkin	Vote – Remove: 2 Relist: 11 Abstain: 1
Purple Potato Juice	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Red Cabbage Color	Vote – Remove: 2 Relist: 11 Abstain: 1
Red Radish Extract Color	Vote – Remove: 6 Relist: 6 Abstain: 2
Saffron Extract Color	Vote – Remove: 7 Relist: 5 Abstain: 2
Turmeric Extract Color	Vote – Remove: 3 Relist: 9 Abstain: 2
**Note that 2/3 majority is needed to remove a material from the National List. For this meeting there	
were 14 members. Abstentions do not count towards the vote.	

IMPORTANT: NOSB is an advisory body to the Secretary of Agriculture. NOSB recommendations are not NOP policy unless NOP issues Final rules, Final guidance, Final instructions, or a policy memorandum that adopts the NOSB recommendations. They are not part of the USDA organic regulations unless such action is taken.

NOSB Officer Elections and Outgoing Board Members

Officer elections were held at the end of the four-day meeting. Tracy Favre (Resource Conservation Seat) was elected to serve as the new Chair, Tom Chapman (Handler Seat) was elected to serve as the new Vice-Chair, and Lisa de Lima (Retailer Seat) was elected to serve as the new Secretary. OTA thanks Jean Richardson for her excellent leadership as Chair of the last three NOSB meetings, and we extend our thanks to outgoing Board members Mac Stone (Certifier Seat), Colehour Bondera (Producer Seat), Calvin Rueben Walker (Consumer Interest Seat) and Jennifer Taylor (Consumer Interest Seat) for their five years of service and dedication to the organic sector.

Plan to attend the spring 2016 NOSB meeting! The next NOSB meeting will take place **April 25-27, 2016,** at the Omni Shoreham Hotel in Washington, D.C. Mark your calendar, and plan to attend the networking reception OTA will be hosting. More information to come!

Organic Trade Association NOSB Report

As a service to its members, OTA attends National Organic Standards Board meetings. The *NOSB Report*, a member publication, summarizes the meeting and provides an overview of the agenda topics, public commentary, and key decisions made NOSB.

The items included in this report represent recommendations that NOSB developed and reviewed at its meetings. If accepted by the Board, recommendations pass to the National Organic Program, which determines the final form of the NOSB recommendations. OTA members are alerted to steps in rulemaking through OTA's *News Flash* or other member communications.

OTA's <u>NOSB Report archives</u> are available on OTA's website. Please contact OTA's Senior Director of Regulatory and Technical Affairs <u>Gwendolyn</u> Wyard or Nathaniel Lewis, OTA's Senior Crops and Livestock Specialist.

Headquarters: The Hall of the States, 444 N. Capitol St. NW, Suite 445-A, Washington D.C. 20001 – (202) 403-8513 Member Services: 28 Vernon St, Suite 413, Brattleboro VT 05301 – (802) 275-3800 – Fax: (802) 275-3801 – www.ota.com