

## NOSB FALL 2020 MEETING

### SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS, DISCUSSION DOCUMENTS & SUNSET REVIEWS

The fall 2020 National Organic Standards Board (NOSB) Meeting will be held October 28-30 via live online webinar. The [Meeting Agenda](#) and [Meeting Packet](#) (all proposals, discussion documents, and sunset reviews to be considered at the meeting) are posted, and the public comment period is open. The deadline to submit written comments and/or sign up for oral comments is **October 1<sup>st</sup>** at midnight Eastern. The full Board will vote on the proposals and sunsets at the meeting. Check out [OTA's NOSB Meeting Webpage](#) for more information.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT OPPORTUNITIES

**WRITTEN COMMENTS** may be submitted via [Regulations.gov](#) (Docket AMS-NOP-20-0041) **by October 1<sup>st</sup>**.

**WEBINAR (ORAL) COMMENTS** (3-minute slot) may occur during one of two webinar sessions on October 20 & 22, 2020 between Noon – 5:00 pm Eastern. [Click here to register](#) **by October 1<sup>st</sup>**.

#### AT-A-GLANCE LIST OF TOPICS

##### PROPOSALS (vote)

- **Paper-Based Planting Aids** – *petition to allow in crop production with restrictions on biobased content*
- **Fish for Liquid Fish Fertilizers** – *proposal to restrict the harvesting of wild native fish used in fertilizers*
- **Marine Macroalgae** – *proposal to restrict the harvesting of seaweed/kelp used in fertilizers*
- **Sodium Carbonate Lignin** – *petition to allow in crop production as a dust suppressant*
- **Fenbendazole (Livestock)** – *petition to allow in poultry production as parasiticide for laying hens*
- **Low Acyl Gellan Gum (Processing)** – *petition to allow in food processing as a gelling agent*
- **Ion Exchange Filtration (Processing)** – *proposal on the use of resins, membranes, and recharge materials*
- **2020 Research Priorities**

##### SUNSET REVIEWS (vote)

- *NOSB is will vote on over 50 inputs currently included on the National List of Allowed and Prohibited Substances to determine whether the substances should continue to be listed or should be removed.*

##### DISCUSSION DOCUMENTS (no vote)

- **Ammonia Extract Fertilizers** – *discussion on a petition to prohibit ammonia extract fertilizers*
- **Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film** – *discussion the allowance of biodegradable films that are not 100% biobased*
- **Whey Protein Concentrate (Processing)** – *discussion on a petition to prohibit this substance in food processing*
- **Consent Agenda Calendar Voting** – *discussion on whether to adopt a consent agenda voting procedure*
- **Human Capital Management** – *discussion on developing and retaining qualified organic inspectors and reviewers*

## SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS AND DISCUSSION DOCUMENTS

### CROPS SUBCOMMITTEE

#### Paper-Based Crop Planting Aids (Proposal)

- **BACKGROUND:** Paper planting pots have been petitioned for inclusion on the National List as an allowed input. Paper pots and other growing container and production aids are used to support seeding, growing and/or transplanting in the field and are intended to remain in the soil.
- **PROPOSAL:** The Crop Subcommittee has developed a proposal it believes meets the needs of producers while addressing environmental concerns that might be associated with some types of paper.

Add the following definition to 205.2 Terms defined:

***Paper-based crop planting aid.*** A material that is comprised of at least 60% cellulose-based fiber by weight, including, but not limited to, pots, seed tape, and collars that are placed in or on the soil and later incorporated into the soil. Contains no less than 80% biobased content as verified by a qualified third party assessment (e.g. laboratory test using ASTM D6866 or composition review by qualified personnel).

Add the following listing to 205.601(o) Production Aids:

**Paper-based crop planting aids as defined in 205.2. Virgin or recycled paper without glossy paper or colored inks. Added pesticides or nutrients must comply with §205.105, 205.203, and 205.206.**

Read the full proposal in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 3-10)

- **SUBCOMMITTEE VOTE:** Motion to adopt the proposal: **6 Yes, 1 No**, 1 Absent

#### Fish for Liquid Fish Products (Proposal)

- **BACKGROUND:** Liquid fish products are permitted as fertilizers in organic production. Stakeholders have raised concerns about the environmental impact of harvesting wild, native fish for this use.
- **PROPOSAL:** The purpose of this proposal is to limit the impact of harvesting wild, native fish for fertilizer and to ensure that liquid fish fertilizer products used in organic production are not harmful to the environment.

Amend the listing of liquid fish products at 205.601(j)(8) as follows (bold text is new):

Liquid fish products – **sourced only from fish waste, bycatch, or invasive species** – can be pH adjusted with sulfuric, citric or phosphoric acid. The amount of acid used shall not exceed the minimum needed to lower the pH to 3.5.

Add the following definitions to 205.2 Terms defined:

***Fish waste.*** Waste or byproduct left over after market fish are processed for human consumption.

***Bycatch.*** Incidental or discarded catch that have no economic value, fish that must be discarded because of management regulations, or fish that are killed by fishing gear (mortality).

Read the full proposal in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 11-19)

- **SUBCOMMITTEE VOTE:** Motion to adopt the proposal: **8 Yes**, 0 No

### **Sodium Carbonate Lignin (Proposal)**

- **BACKGROUND:** Sodium carbonate lignin has been petitioned for addition to the National List at 205.601(j)(4) for allowance in fertilizer as a dust suppressant. This substance results from a paper pulping process that uses sodium carbonate and sodium hydroxide to extract lignin.
- **PROPOSAL:** The Crop Subcommittee does not recommend adding sodium carbonate lignin to the National List as a dust suppressant. The proposal to allow the substance failed because there are numerous lignin alternatives already available for use.

Read the full proposal in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 21-24)

- **SUBCOMMITTEE VOTE:** Motion to adopt the proposal: 0 Yes, **6 No**, 2 Absent

### **Ammonia Extract Fertilizers (Discussion Document)**

- **BACKGROUND:** Ammonia extract has been petitioned for inclusion on the National List as a prohibited input in organic crop production. A third-party technical review is in development.
- **DISCUSSION DOCUMENT:** The Crops Subcommittee seeks input from the technical review process and from stakeholders to answer the following questions:
  1. Is it difficult to distinguish between ammonia derived from natural and synthetic sources (the petitioner claims it is difficult and can only be determined by assaying the N isotopes)? In addressing this question please consider the distinction between ease of chemical analysis in a laboratory and the realities of distinguishing between ammonia sources in a commercial setting where fertilizer blending is common.
  2. What are the impacts of ammonia extract application on soil organic matter content, the microbiome of the soil, soil faunal diversity and other soil “health” indicators?
  3. Is the description presented in the petition defining ammonia products sufficiently precise to classify all ammonia-based products? If not, provide a more precise and inclusive over-arching definition.
  4. Are there any other issues with ammonia use in organic crop production that the NOSB should be aware of?

Read the full discussion document in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 47)

### **Biodegradable Biobased Mulch Film (Discussion Document)**

- **BACKGROUND:** Biodegradable biobased mulch film is currently listed on the National List of allowed materials for crop production as a weed barrier, although no commercially available products meet the regulatory terms of allowance. The Crops Subcommittee is re-issuing its previous discussion document

updated links and questions below. The Subcommittee plans to vote on an annotation addressing biodegradable mulch film that is not 100% biobased in spring 2021.

- **DISCUSSION DOCUMENT:** The Subcommittee poses a number of questions regarding biodegradable mulch (BDM) film. Please comment on which of the following mutually exclusive options for regulating films that are not 100% biobased you think is best:
  1. Continue with the current annotation with no change;
  2. Allow BDM film use followed by ploughing into soil (with some consideration for off-site transport), with monitoring and assessment to determine whether there are adverse impacts; or
  3. Allow BDM film use but require that it be gathered up at the end of the season followed by on-farm or off-farm composting, if feasible; or
  4. Allow BDM film use but restrict its use in certain environments where biodegradation may not occur in a reasonable time.

Read the full discussion document in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 49-52)

## HANDLING SUBCOMMITTEE

### **Low Acyl Gellan Gum (Proposal)**

- **BACKGROUND:** Low acyl gellan gum (CAS# 71010-52-1) has been petitioned to for inclusion on the National List at 205.605(b) as a synthetic substance. Low acyl gellan gum is used as a gelling agent in various food formulations. Gellan gum, in a high acyl form as a nonsynthetic substance is already included on the National List at 205.605(a).
- **PROPOSAL:** The Handling Subcommittee supported the proposal to add Low acyl gellan gum to the National List at §205.605(b). This substance provides distinct functional properties and poses negligible impact to human health or the environment.

Read the full proposal in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 53-59)

- **SUBCOMMITTEE VOTE:** Motion to adopt the proposal: **6 Yes**, 0 No, 1 Abstain

### **Ion Exchange Filtration (Proposal)**

- **BACKGROUND:** Ion exchange filtration is a food processing technique used to facilitate removal of impurities from a liquid using a chemical exchange process. NOP sent a [memo](#) to NOSB on August 27, 2019 requesting that NOSB provide recommendations related to ion exchange filtration and the use of ion exchange resins/membranes and recharge materials.
- **PROPOSAL:** The Subcommittee recommends that recharge materials used to recharge ion exchange resins must be on the National List if they are used in the processing of organic product. However, the resins and membranes, classified as food contact substances, do not need to be reviewed or included on the National List.

Read the full proposal in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 61-64)

- **SUBCOMMITTEE VOTE:** Motion to adopt the proposal: **6 Yes**, 0 No, 1 Abstain

## Whey Protein Concentrate (Discussion Document)

- **BACKGROUND:** Whey protein concentrate has been petition for removal from the National List. This substance currently is listed at 205.606 and is also undergoing Sunset Review at this meeting. Used as a protein source, fat replacer, and as a texturizer in a wide variety of dairy products, protein bars, and infant formulas.
- **DISCUSSION DOCUMENT:** The Handling Subcommittee seeks public comment on the following questions:
  1. The NOSB received a number of public comments at the spring, 2020 public meeting that there is an adequate supply of organic whey protein concentrate to meet all the market demands for this material. To best inform its final sunset review decision at its fall 2020 meeting, the Board is interested in hearing feedback on the following questions. Are there any specific forms of organic whey protein concentrate that are not available in organic form or quantity?
  2. Are there any reasons that there is not an adequate organic supply of whey protein concentrate to meet the market demand?

Read the full discussion document in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 103-104)

## LIVESTOCK SUBCOMMITTEE

### Fenbendazole (Proposal)

- **BACKGROUND:** Fenbendazole is a parasiticide currently allowed in organic production for emergency treatment for dairy and breeder stock and fiber-bearing animals under the restrictions at §205.603(a)(23). A petition has been submitted to expand its use in laying hens and replacement chickens intended to become laying hens.
- **PROPOSAL:** The Livestock Subcommittee presents a proposal to accept the petition and amend to the listing for Fenbendazole at 7 CFR §205.603 (23)(i) to include use in laying hens or replacement chickens intended to be laying hens.

Read the full proposal in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 105-111)

- **SUBCOMMITTEE VOTE:** Motion to adopt the proposal: **4 Yes, 2 No**

## MATERIALS SUBCOMMITTEE

### Marine Macroalgae in Crop Fertility Inputs (Proposal)

- **BACKGROUND:** Marine macroalgae such as seaweeds and kelp commonly used in the manufacture of crop production inputs such as fertilizers and soil conditioners. Stakeholders have raised concerns about the environmental impact of harvesting marine macroalgae for this use.
- **PROPOSAL:** The Materials Subcommittee is proposing an annotation to marine macroalgae used as crop fertility inputs to provide parameters on harvesting addressing conservation areas, bottom trawling, protecting reproduction of the population and ecosystem functions, biomass and architecture, and

bycatch.

Amend the listing of aquatic plant extracts at §205.601(j)(1) as follows (bold text is new):

Aquatic plant extracts (other than hydrolyzed) – Extraction process is limited to the use of potassium hydroxide or sodium hydroxide; solvent amount use is limited to that amount necessary for extraction. **Harvest Parameters - Prohibited harvest areas: established conservation areas under federal, state, or local ownership, public or private, including parks, preserves, sanctuaries, refuges, or areas identified as important or high value habitats at the state or federal level. Prohibited harvest methods: bottom trawling and harvest practices that prevent reproduction and diminish the regeneration of natural populations. Harvest practices should ensure that sufficient propagules, holdfasts, and reproductive structures are available to maintain the abundance and size structure of the population and its ecosystem functions. Harvest timing: repeat harvest is prohibited until biomass and architecture (density and height) of the targeted species approaches the biomass and architecture of undisturbed natural stands of the targeted species in that area. Bycatch: must be monitored and prevented, or eliminated in the case of special status species protected by U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service or National Marine Fisheries Service.**

Create a new listing at §205.602 (Prohibited Nonsynthetics) to prohibit marine macroalgae unless produced in accordance with the following annotation (identical to that proposed for 205.601(j)(1))

**Marine macroalgae (seaweed) – unless harvested in accordance to the following parameters: Non-commercial harvests for whole and unprocessed seaweed are exempt from these parameters. Harvest Parameters - Prohibited harvest areas: established conservation areas under federal, state, or local ownership, public or private, including parks, preserves, sanctuaries, refuges, or areas identified as important or high value habitats at the state or federal level. Prohibited harvest methods: bottom trawling and harvest practices that prevent reproduction and diminish the regeneration of natural populations. Harvest practices should ensure that sufficient propagules<sup>10</sup>, holdfasts, and reproductive structures are available to maintain the abundance and size structure of the population and its ecosystem functions. Harvest timing: repeat harvest is prohibited until biomass and architecture (density and height) of the targeted species approaches the biomass and architecture of undisturbed natural stands of the targeted species in that area. Bycatch: must be monitored and prevented, or eliminated in the case of special status species protected by U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service or National Marine Fisheries Service.**

Read the full proposal in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 145-167)

- **SUBCOMMITTEE VOTE:** Motion to adopt the proposal: **5 Yes**, 0 No, 1 Absent

## Research Priorities 2020 (Proposal)

- **BACKGROUND:** Since adopting its Research Priorities Framework in 2012, NOSB has presented an annual list of research priorities for organic food and agriculture. The priorities are proposed by NOSB's Livestock, Crops, Handling, and Materials/GMO Subcommittees and are revisited and updated each year to ensure accurate reflection of existing need for new knowledge.
- **PROPOSAL:** The Materials Subcommittee presents the following list of research priorities.

#### **Livestock**

1. Evaluation of methionine in the context of a system approach in organic poultry production.
2. Prevention and management of parasites, examining breeds, geographical differences, alternative treatments, and pasture species.
3. Organic livestock breeding for animals adapted to outdoor life and living vegetation.

#### **Crops**

1. Examination of decomposition rates, the effects of residues on soil biology, and the factors that affect the breakdown of biodegradable bio-based mulch film.
2. Conduct whole farm ecosystem service assessments to determine the economic, social, and environmental impact of farming systems choices.
3. Organic no-till practices for diverse climates, crops, and soil types.
4. Develop cover cropping practices that come closer to meeting the annual fertility demands of commonly grown organic crops.
5. Development of systems-based plant disease management strategies are needed to address existing and emerging plant disease threats.
6. The demand for organic nursery stock far exceeds the supply. Research is needed to identify the barriers to expanding this market, then develop and assess organic methods for meeting the growing demand for organically grown nursery stock.
7. Strategies for the prevention, management, and control of invasive insects and weeds.
8. Factors impacting organic crop nutrition, and organic/conventional nutrition comparisons.
9. Side-by-side trials of organic synthetic materials, natural materials, and cultural methods, with a request for collaboration with the IR4 project.
10. Impartial evaluation of microbial inoculants, soil conditioners, and other amendments is needed as there is little objective evidence upon which to assess their contribution to soil health.
11. More research, extension, and education are needed to fully understand the relationship between on-farm biodiversity and pathogen presence and abundance.
12. Elucidate practices that reduce greenhouse gas emissions and that contribute to farming systems resilience in the face of climate change.

#### **Food Handling and Processing**

1. Evaluation of alternatives to chlorine materials in processing: impact mitigation, best management practices, and potential for chlorine absorption by produce.
2. Suitable alternatives to BPA (Bisphenol-A) for linings of cans used for various products.

#### **Coexistence with GE and Organic Crops**

1. Outcome of genetically engineered (GMO/GE) material in organic compost.
2. Evaluation of public germplasm collections of at-risk crops for the presence of GE traits, and ways to mitigate small amounts of unwanted genetic material in breeding lines.
3. Develop then implement methods of assessing the genetic integrity of crops at risk in order to quantify the current state of the organic and conventionally produced non-GMO seed.
4. Techniques for preventing adventitious presence of GE material in organic crops, and evaluation of the effectiveness of current prevention strategies.
5. Testing for fraud by developing and implementing new technologies and practices.

#### **General**

1. Examination of the factors influencing access to organically produced foods.

2. Production and yield barriers to transitioning to organic production to help growers successfully complete the transition.

Read the full proposal in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 133-143)

- **SUBCOMMITTEE VOTE:** Motion to adopt the proposal: **5 Yes**, 0 No, 1 Absent

## COMPLIANCE, ACCREDITATION, & CERTIFICATION SUBCOMMITTEE

### **Human Capital Management (Discussion Document)**

- **BACKGROUND:** Human capital refers to the skills, knowledge, and experience held by an individual or population, and is generally considered one of the most important intangible assets that contributes value to an organization or community. NOP sent a [memo](#) to NOSB on July 31, 2020 requesting that the Board facilitate a public discussion related to Human Capital Strategy for Organic Inspectors and Reviewers. The memo presents several key areas of human capital and poses questions to support an inclusive discussion.
- **DISCUSSION DOCUMENT:** The Compliance, Accreditation & Certification Subcommittee is building on the ongoing discussion topic of inspector and reviewer qualifications and training, summarizing a broader set of human capital dimensions that are needed to develop, support, and retain a robust and well-supported pipeline of certification professionals over time. The Subcommittee invites stakeholders to submit comments on this topic.
- Read the full discussion document in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 1)

## POLICY DEVELOPMENT SUBCOMMITTEE

### **Consent Agenda Calendar Voting (Discussion Document)**

- **BACKGROUND:** The Policy Development Subcommittee is discussing the use of a consent agenda for voting on Sunset items that are similar, in an effort to save time at the NOSB meetings.
- **DISCUSSION DOCUMENT:** The Policy Development Subcommittee is seeking feedback from the full Board and public commenters to see if there is support for using a consent agenda process where similar agenda items are grouped into a single agenda item for voting purposes.

Read the full discussion document in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 173)



## 2022 SUNSET REVIEW

NOSB will vote on whether to continue the allowance of several substances currently included on the National List of Allowed and Prohibited Substances to determine whether the substances should continue to be listed or should be relisted or removed from the list. These substances are undergoing Sunset Review this year in advance of their expiration (sunset) date in 2022. These inputs may not be renewed if new information indicates they are harmful to human health or the environment, or incompatible with organic production.

### CROPS 2022 SUNSET REVIEW

Read the full proposals for crop sunset reviews in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 25-46)

- **Soap-based algicide/demossers (Sunset Review)**
  - Used to control algae and moss build-up on irrigation systems. §205.601(a)(7)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 8 to relist
- **Ammonium carbonate (Sunset Review)**
  - Used for bait in insect traps. §205.601(e)(1)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 8 to relist
- **Insecticidal soaps (Sunset Review)**
  - Used for pest control. §205.601(e)(8)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 8 to relist
- **Vitamin D3 (Sunset Review)**
  - Used for rodent control. §205.601(g)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 6 to relist, 2 absent
- **Aquatic plant extracts (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a fertilizer and soil amendment. §205.601(j)(1)
  - Subcommittee Vote: **1 to remove**, 3 to relist, 2 abstain, 2 absent
- **Lignin sulfonate (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a chelating agent and dust suppressant. §205.601(j)(4)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 7 to relist, 1 absent
- **Sodium silicate (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a floating agent in postharvest handling of tree fruit and fiber. §205.601(l)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 8 to relist
- **EPA List 4 Inerts of Minimal Concern (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as inactive ingredients or adjuvants formulated with allowed pesticide active ingredients. §205.601(m)

- Subcommittee Vote: **7 to remove**, 1 to relist
- **Arsenic (Sunset Review)**
  - Prohibited. §205.602(b)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 6 to relist, 2 absent
- **Strychnine (Sunset Review)**
  - Prohibited. §205.602(i)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 6 to relist, 2 absent

## LIVESTOCK 2022 SUNSET REVIEW

Read the full proposals for livestock sunset reviews in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 113-131)

- **Butorphanol (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a pre-operative treatment of pain before surgical procedures in livestock. §205.603(a)(5)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 1 absent
- **Flunixin (Sunset Review)**
  - Used to treat inflammation and pyrexia. §205.603(a)(12)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 1 absent
- **Magnesium hydroxide (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as an antacid and laxative. §205.603(a)(18)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 1 absent
- **Poloxalene (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as an emergency bloat treatment. §205.603(a)(26)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 1 absent
- **Formic Acid (Sunset Review)**
  - Used to control Varroa mites in honeybee hives. §205.603(b)(3)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 6 to relist
- **EPA List 4 Inerts of Minimal Concern (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as inactive ingredients or adjuvants formulated with allowed pesticide active ingredients. §205.603(e)
  - Subcommittee Vote: **2 to remove**, 4 to relist
- **Excipients (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as inactive ingredients formulated with allowed active medical treatment ingredients.

Includes substances (1) Identified by FDA as Generally Recognized As Safe; (2) Approved by the FDA as a food additive; (3) Included in FDA review and approval of a New Animal Drug Application or New Drug Application; or (4) Approved by APHIS for use in veterinary biologics. §205.603(f)

- Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 1 absent
- **Strychnine (Sunset Review)**
  - Prohibited. §205.604(a)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 6 to relist

## HANDLING 2022 SUNSET REVIEW

Read the full proposals for handling sunset reviews in the [NOSB Meeting Packet](#) (p. 65-102)

- **Kaolin (Sunset Review)**
  - Allowed as an ingredient or processing aid. Used as an anti-caking agent and filtering agent. §205.605(a)
  - Subcommittee Vote: **1 to remove**, 6 to relist
- **Sodium bicarbonate (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a leavening agent (baking soda); common ingredient in baking powder. §205.605(a)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 7 to relist
- **Wood rosin (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a component of fruit wax, primarily for citrus. §205.605(a)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 7 to relist
- **Ammonia bicarbonate (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a leaving agent. §205.605(b)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 2 absent
- **Ammonia carbonate (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a leaving agent. §205.605(b)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 2 absent
- **Calcium phosphates (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as aluminum-free and reduced-sodium leavening agent, baking powder ingredient, and dough conditioner in a wide variety of baked goods. Monobasic calcium phosphate also used as firming agent in canned fruits and vegetables. Dibasic calcium phosphate also used in enriched flour, noodle products, breakfast cereals, and cheese products. Tribasic calcium phosphate also used as an anti-caking agent, buffering agent, and free-flow aid in finely powdered salt used in baking. §205.605(b)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 2 absent

- **Ozone (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as an equipment and food disinfectant and in post-harvest treatment of produce to reduce/control microorganisms for food safety purposes. §205.605(b)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 7 to relist
- **Sodium hydroxide (Sunset Review)**
  - Used in pretzel manufacturing as caustic bath. Used as processing aid for cocoa manufacturing and for removing bitterness from olives. Prohibited for use in lye peeling of fruits and vegetables. §205.605(b)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 5 to relist, 2 absent
- **Carnauba wax (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a component of coatings for fruit, candy and nuts. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available.
  - Subcommittee Vote: **4 to remove**, 2 to relist, 2 absent
- **Colors (Sunset Review)**
  - The following colors are individually listed §205.606(d) and only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available.
  - 1) Beet juice extract color—derived from *Beta vulgaris* L., except must not be produced from sugar beets.
    - Subcommittee Vote: **2 to remove**, 4 to relist, 1 absent
  - 2) Beta-carotene extract color—derived from carrots (*Daucus carota* L.) or algae (*Dunaliella salina*).
    - Subcommittee Vote: **2 to remove**, 4 to relist, 1 absent
  - 3) Black currant juice color—derived from *Ribes nigrum* L.
    - Subcommittee Vote: **3 to remove**, 3 to relist, 1 absent
  - 4) Black/purple carrot juice color—derived from *Daucus carota* L.
    - Subcommittee Vote: **2 to remove**, 4 to relist, 1 absent
  - 5) Blueberry juice color—derived from blueberries (*Vaccinium spp.*).
    - Subcommittee Vote: **4 to remove**, 2 to relist, 1 absent
  - 6) Carrot juice color—derived from *Daucus carota* L.
    - Subcommittee Vote: **5 to remove**, 1 to relist, 1 absent
  - 7) Cherry juice color—derived from *Prunus avium* (L.) L. or *Prunus cerasus* L.
    - Subcommittee Vote: **3 to remove**, 3 to relist, 1 absent
  - 8) Chokeberry, aronia juice color—derived from *Aronia arbutifolia* (L.) Pers. or *Aronia melanocarpa* (Michx.) Elliott.
    - Subcommittee Vote: **1 to remove**, 5 to relist, 1 absent
  - 9) Elderberry juice color—derived from *Sambucus nigra* L.
    - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 6 to relist, 1 absent
  - 10) Grape juice color—derived from *Vitis vinifera* L.
    - Subcommittee Vote: **3 to remove**, 3 to relist, 1 absent
  - 11) Grape skin extract color—derived from *Vitis vinifera* L.
    - Subcommittee Vote: **3 to remove**, 3 to relist, 1 absent
  - 12) Paprika color—derived from dried powder or vegetable oil extract of *Capsicum annuum* L.

- Subcommittee Vote: **5 to remove**, 1 to relist, 1 absent
- 13) Pumpkin juice color—derived from *Cucurbita pepo* L. or *Cucurbita maxima* Duchesne.
  - Subcommittee Vote: **3 to remove**, 3 to relist, 1 absent
- 14) Purple sweet potato juice color—derived from *Ipomoea batatas* L. or *Solanum tuberosum* L.
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 6 to relist, 1 absent
- 15) Red cabbage extract color—derived from *Brassica oleracea* L.
  - Subcommittee Vote: **3 to remove**, 3 to relist, 1 absent
- 16) Red radish extract color—derived from *Raphanus sativus* L.
  - Subcommittee Vote: **2 to remove**, 4 to relist, 1 absent
- 17) ) Saffron extract color—derived from *Crocus sativus* L.
  - Subcommittee Vote: **2 to remove**, 4 to relist, 1 absent
- 18) ) Turmeric extract color—derived from *Curcuma longa* L.
  - Subcommittee Vote: **4 to remove**, 2 to relist, 1 absent
- **Glycerin (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as carrier, binder, humectant, and solvent for natural flavors and extracts. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available. §205.606(h)
  - The manufacturing process of glycerin will determine if it can be classified as an agricultural substance and permitted in non-organic form under the listing at §205.606. The eligibility for glycerin to be certified organic depends on the organic certification status of the raw material and subsequent processing must be compliant with the NOP regulations and certified by an accredited certification agency.
  - Subcommittee Vote: **2 to remove**, 3 to relist, 1 abstain, 1 absent
- **Inulin-oligofructose enriched (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a non-digestible carbohydrate to improve calcium bioavailability and absorption, to serve as soluble dietary fiber or a prebiotic ingredient, and to enhance the texture and consistency in a wide variety of foods. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available. §205.606(j)
  - Subcommittee Vote: 0 to remove, 6 to relist, 1 absent
- **Kelp (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a thickener and dietary supplement. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available. §205.606(k)
  - Subcommittee Vote: **1 to remove**, 6 to relist
- **Orange shellac, unbleached (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a fruit and vegetable coating and confectionary glaze. Used as an ingredient in capsules and tablets. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available. §205.606(o)
  - Subcommittee Vote: **3 to remove**, 3 to relist, 1 absent
- **Cornstarch, native (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as thickener, formulation aid, bulking agent, diluent, fluidifying agent, and moisture-adsorbing agent in a wide variety of foods. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available. §205.606(s)(1)

- Subcommittee Vote: **4 to remove**, 3 to relist
- **Sweet potato starch (Sunset Review)**
  - Used for bean thread production to give organic processed foods such as soups and pot stickers the texture of authentic Asian cooking. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available. §205.606(s)(2)
  - Subcommittee Vote: **4 to remove**, 3 to relist
- **Turkish bay leaves (Sunset Review)**
  - Uses as an herb for flavor development. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available. §205.606(u)
  - Subcommittee Vote: **5 to remove**, 1 to relist, 1 absent
- **Whey protein concentrate (Sunset Review)**
  - Used as a protein source, fat replacer, and as a texturizer in a wide variety of dairy products, protein bars, and infant formulas. Only permitted when organic forms are not commercially available. §205.606(w)
  - Subcommittee Vote: **6 to remove**, 0 to relist, 1 absent